

SANTA ROSA & SAN JACINTO MOUNTAINS

NATIONAL MONUMENT

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT

OF

PROCEEDINGS

LOCATION: Palm Desert City Hall
City Council Chambers
Palm Desert, CA

DATE AND TIME: Saturday, February 1, 2003
9 a.m. to 1:45 p.m.

REPORTED BY: JUDITH W. GILLESPIE, CSR, RPR
CSR NO. 3710

JOB NO.: 61999JG

2

3 MONUMENT ADVISORY COMMITTEE (MAC):

4 FRANK BOGERT, Former Mayor, City of Palm Springs
5 BUFORD CRITES, Councilmember and Former Mayor, City of
6 Palm Desert
7 BARY FREET, Palm Springs Fire Chief, Resident of
8 Cathedral City
9 MICHAEL KELLNER, representing BARBARA GONZALES-LYONS
10 LARRY GRAFTON, Senior Planner, City of Indian Wells
11 TERRY HENDERSON, Councilmember, City of La Quinta
12 EDWARD KIBBEY, Committee Chairman, Building Industry
13 Association
14 BOB LYMAN, Regional Office Manager, County of
15 Riverside
16 JEFFERY MORGAN, Sierra Club, Local Conservation
17 Organization
18 ALLAN MUTH, University of California, Riverside,
19 Deep Canyon Research Center
20 ROB PARKINS, General Manager for the Palm Springs
21 Aerial Tramway, Winter Park Authority
22 MARY ROCHE, Mayor Pro Tem, Indian Wells
23 WILLIAM (GARY) WATTS, District Superintendent,
24 California Department of Parks and Recreation
25

STAFF:

26 DANELLA GEORGE, Designated Federal Official,
27 National Monument Manager
28 CONNELL DUNNING, Community Planner, Bureau of Land
29 Management, Palm Springs/South Coast
30 Field Office
31 JIM KENNA, BLM Field Manager, Palm Springs/South
32 Coast Field Office
33 EDDY KONNO, California Department of Fish & Game
34 LAURIE ROSENTHAL, USDA Forest Service, District
35 Ranger, San Jacinto Ranger District
36 KATIE BARROWS, Coachella Valley Mountains Conservancy
37 RACHELLE HUDDLESTON-LORTON, Biologist, BLM Palm
38 Springs, South Coast Field Office
39
40
41
42
43
44
45

1 I N D E X

2

3 CALL MEETING TO ORDER - Chairman

4 PUBLIC COMMENT -
5 JOHN C. KRIEG

6 REVIEW OF LAST MEETING/OTHER BUSINESS - Chairman

7 HOUSEKEEPING, UPDATE FROM DESIGNATED FEDERAL
8 OFFICER - DANELLA GEORGE, Designated Federal Official

9 AGENCY UPDATES
10 JIM KENNA, Field Manager, BLM
11 LAURIE ROSENTHAL, District Ranger

12 BLM INTERIM MONUMENT TRAILS MANAGEMENT
13 RACHELLE HUDDLESTON-LORTON

14 UPDATE OF THE COACHELLA VALLEY MULTI-SPECIES
15 TRAILS PLAN - KATIE BARROWS, Coachella Valley
16 Mountains Conservancy

17 WHERE DOES THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE WANT TO GO IN
18 2003 AND BEYOND? (A SHORT MISSION STATEMENT)
19 ED KIBBEY, DANELLA GEORGE

20 LUNCH

21 PUBLIC INPUT
22 DUSTIN VAN NEWLEN

23 DISCUSSION ON MONUMENT PLAN
24 CONNELL DUNNING, Community Planner

25 SUMMARIZE MEETING AND NEEDS FOR THE APRIL
26 MAC MEETING - DANELLA GEORGE, Designated Federal
27 Official

28 ADJOURNMENT
29 ED KIBBEY, Chair

1 Palm Desert, CA

Saturday, February 1, 2003

2

3

P R O C E E D I N G S

4

-o0o-

5

6

7

8

CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Ladies and gentlemen, it

9

appears we have a quorum. Again, we haven't had the

10

reappointment of those who are up for reappointment, and we

11

apologize for that. I think you know the reason. I sent all

12

of you copies of the correspondence in that regard.

13

Again, if we do any votes, I want everyone to

14

vote, except for Mary, of course, and identify -- we will ask

15

you to identify yourself and your vote following the official

16

vote so that if there is ever any challenge, then we will be

17

able to address that challenge.

18

So, with that, the meeting is called to order

19

and we open up with the public comment period. I don't have

20

anyone who has signed up. Is there anyone in the public who

21

wishes to comment at this time?

22

MS. DUNNING: Yes, just one.

23

CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I do have one, John Krieg.

24

MR. KRIEG: My name is John Krieg. I'm a

25

landscape architect and land planner. I live in Anza, very

4

1 close to the Ramona reservation.

2 I am here to represent the Ramonas today. I
3 have a letter from them authorizing our representation. I am
4 representing the Ramona Band of Cahuilla Indians. They have
5 570 acres in the Anza area. They are about six miles away
6 from your western boundary.

7 And they would like to make you aware of their
8 efforts to build an eco-tourism center. They seem like they
9 have parallel goals as the goals of the National Monument.
10 They would like to be considered for inclusion. If not
11 inclusion, some form of association.

12 I don't know what more I can tell you about the
13 Ramonas. I know that the eco-tourism center is to promote
14 environmental causes, alternative energy uses, and basically
15 that's it. So we would like to make you aware of who we are,
16 what we are trying to do, and see how we can interface with
17 you.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you. Any questions?

19 MR. CRITES: During our morning break, we
20 might look at a map or something and just see what proximity
21 and where and so on and so forth.

22 MR. KRIEG: I can point it out on that map.

23 I think the two reservations you are most
24 aware of are the Agua Caliente, which is within the
25 boundaries. And Santa Rosa's boundary skirts. Ramona is

1 over here. It's on the southern slope of Thomas Mountain.
2 The Ramona trail goes over Thomas Mountain into Garner
3 Valley. It's also at the head of Bautista Canyon, known for
4 the expedition of Bautista DeAnza, who discovered San
5 Francisco and the overland route and all that.

6 So this is the piece of ground right here, so
7 named after the historic novel by Helen Hunt Jackson, Ramona.
8 The incident that triggered Ramona is right next to the
9 reservation, Juan Diego Flats. Roughly, it's six miles from
10 your boundary, from your stated boundary.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The inclusion of the tribe
12 would certainly be encouraged. We can't as a member of the
13 committee, because you would be outside the boundaries of the
14 Monument. But we would encourage you to have a
15 representative at each one of the meetings as a member of the
16 public. And we would encourage you to speak at that time if
17 you have any input. I think that you will be added to the
18 distribution list if you will let us know your -- hopefully
19 e-mail address, since we do everything by e-mail, if
20 possible. Then we will let you know everything that is
21 happening.

22 MR. KRIEG: Let me pose one question. It
23 isn't meant to be argumentative. I was just wondering. I
24 spent a lot of years in Arizona and I'm familiar with the
25 Sonora National Monument. And there is a part of the

6

1 Monument that is in the Rincon range. And you go about 12
2 miles across Tucson Valley to the other part of the Monument
3 in the Tucson range, and they managed to be part of that
4 work.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, our limits, if you
6 will, of the Monument are set by legislation, which is
7 different from most, if not all, national monuments. And our
8 representation to this committee is also set forth in this
9 legislation, so we are limited by that as to who can sit at
10 the table.

11 However, we have no limits and we have
12 presented no limits at any time to persons taking part as
13 interested citizens in the deliberations of the panel.

14 Bill, I think you had your hand up, or was it
15 Jeff?

16 MR. MORGAN: Also, there is the cultural
17 working group which many of the other Indian tribes that are
18 not in the Monument have attended, and that's also a good
19 interactive --

20 MR. KRIEG: I was made aware of that this
21 morning, and I will certainly explore that route.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We have done our best to
23 include our citizens to the fullest extent we have, and we
24 have done it through the work groups, and it's worked pretty
25 much.

1 MS. GEORGE: Danella George, Monument manager.

2 I will give you my card and get your card, and
3 the agency, separate from the advisory committee, can set up
4 a consultation with tribal council to discuss and show them
5 information about this Monument and what their partnership
6 goals, objectives are and how we can work that out. There
7 are certain things we have done with other tribes here,
8 agreements. So this is good news. We like working with the
9 tribal nations.

10 MR. KRIEG: There is a duality of purpose, at
11 least it seems like, by the stated goals. Okay.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very much.

13 MR. KRIEG: Thank you, sir.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anyone else who wishes to
15 speak? There being none, we will close the public comments
16 section and a review of the last meeting minutes. Did you
17 get those, Danella?

18 MS. GEORGE: No, sir. We did not get the
19 minutes. The minutes have been through review by yourself
20 and by myself and due to, I guess, the holiday season the
21 minutes are not here.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Let it be said that there
23 were quite a few corrections to the minutes. And so we will
24 receive the minutes at our next meeting, along with the
25 minutes of this meeting.

1 Housekeeping, Danella.

2 MS. GEORGE: Housekeeping. Just an update on
3 the appointments. The hope is that at the secretary's office
4 for Department of Ag and for Interior by the April meeting,
5 the new appointments will be blessed and approved. So that's
6 the hope.

7 And along with that process that we have
8 learned about, I wanted to discuss that we need to look at
9 initiating the two-year term appointments which will expire.
10 The two-year term appointments include a representative of
11 Pinyon Community Council, the City of Palm Springs, the City
12 of La Quinta, local conservation organization, local
13 developer or builder organization.

14 And what we have learned from this or what I
15 have learned from all of this in working with our folks at
16 BLM in the state office, the Forest Service folks, getting
17 information from Forest Service Washington office is this is
18 the process.

19 And I am going to say what the process is so we
20 have it on the record. The process will be at this next
21 go-around, we will initiate a Federal Register notice for 30
22 days with a press release in the local papers and as much
23 press as we can to run simultaneously for interested parties.

24 We will require that in those press releases if
25 folks are interested, they will contact our office in writing

1 to show an interest. And we will then send the individuals
2 appropriate Forest Service and BLM forms and nomination
3 packets. That will be sent to individuals. The individuals
4 can then go to the city or to their building organization or
5 to whomever for letters of recommendation.

6 After we have assimilated those packets, it
7 will be my job to get together with Jim Kenna for BLM, Linda
8 Hanson, CDD/BLM, Laurie Rosenthal, district ranger, Forest
9 Service, and Gene Zimmerman for supervisor, San Bernardino.

10 We will look at the packets. We will come to
11 the recommendation conclusion for those five people. And I
12 will write a letter for the board, what is called the board,
13 those four folks and myself, concurring on who we recommend.

14 That letter will then go with sample letters to
15 the State Director and the Regional Forester, with a sample
16 letter of what they would prepare to then go to the
17 Washington office of the Forest Service and the Washington
18 office of the Bureau of Land Management, basically the chief
19 of the Forest Service and the director for the BLM. A joint
20 letter is what we are looking at with Mike Pool, State
21 Director, and Mr. Blackwell, Regional Forester on it, or
22 Blackwood.

23 This would then go on up to the Director and
24 the Chief. And hopefully we'll put a template for a letter
25 for them that will show both their names on it. And it will

10

1 then go to both of the departments. So that's the process.
2 That's what we have to do. And that's that. Any questions?

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We will begin this process
4 next week? And I'm not kidding.

5 MS. GEORGE: We will begin the process after
6 we do the Regional Forester briefing and State Director
7 briefing that we have to do on the status of the draft
8 Monument plan on February the 11th. When we get back from
9 that we will start the process. That's where I need to focus
10 the attention of Connell and her energy and the staff focus
11 with the Monument plan.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So in mid-February we can
13 expect to see advertisements in the newspaper?

14 MS. GEORGE: No. I wouldn't say -- well, we
15 could shoot for mid-February, but mid-February would be like
16 the 14th or 15th. We don't get back until the 12th. We have
17 to do a Federal Register notice, it has to have a review of
18 our district office, and we have to have people review our
19 stuff. So hopefully, let's shoot by the first of March that
20 will be in the local media. To be more realistic is 1 March,
21 around there. And if you can help us, Mr. Chair, with your
22 media contacts, we would greatly appreciate that.

23 We will send it to all the cities so they can
24 post it to all the organizations. We will fax that out so it
25 can be posted far and wide. And if you want to pass it on to

1 your media folks, we would greatly appreciate that.

2 MR. CRITES: Just so we are not left with the
3 lack of quorum, shouldn't we start the three-year ones this
4 year too? Can't we just do them all?

5 MS. GEORGE: We can. We could do that, but I
6 would ask the committee to make that recommendation.

7 MR. WATTS: So moved.

8 MS. GEORGE: Can you make a motion following
9 the rules?

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Buford, would you care to
11 field the motion?

12 MR. CRITES: I would move that we also
13 initiate the process for appropriate consultations to name
14 the appointments for the three-year terms as well this
15 spring.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Do I have a second?

17 MR. HAVERT: Second.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Bill Havert seconds. Any
19 discussion? All in favor?

20 (Voice vote taken.)

21 Any opposed? Motion passes.

22 MS. HENDERSON: Mr. Chairman --

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes. Terry Henderson.

24 MS. HENDERSON: Thank you. Terry Henderson,
25 La Quinta.

1 Do the two-year appointments, which I am one of
2 them, need to wait until mid-March to get our hands on that
3 package, out of fairness, if you will, or can I ask for it
4 now?

5 MS. GEORGE: Danella George, Monument manager.
6 I can ask if there is any problem. But I don't
7 see why not. We have just announced it in the public forum,
8 so I don't see -- yes, we will get you the packets.

9 MS. HENDERSON: Thank you very much.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: For your information, I just
11 turned in my sheets for the background for the United States
12 Department of Agriculture, which all of you were sent, by the
13 way, on e-mail.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anything else, Danella?

15 MS. GEORGE: Yes, Mr. Chair, there is.

16 Along with that and later in the morning there
17 will be a presentation on the charter, about what we need to
18 look at because the charter, too, will expire upon signature
19 of the Monument plan. But for this advisory committee, we
20 will not need to go through the kind of long-term process.
21 It will be a little bit smoother process of having
22 concurrence level at the secretary's level is what has been
23 provided to me. We have to go through that whole food chain,
24 but we won't be out soliciting nominations, appointment
25 packets, these kind of things. So hopefully, that will move

1 faster. And after today's discussion, if the committee wants
2 to stay together and continue to move forward, I will start
3 that process for the committee.

4 The next thing to talk about is the Federal
5 Register meeting on notice that we talked about. We talked
6 about having it go through December of 2003. We are thinking
7 about going ahead and adding February, so it's a whole year.
8 We can do that. The agency can do that. Just go ahead and
9 add it through February, 2004.

10 And just a reminder that at the next meeting on
11 April the 5th, the public comments would be from 11:00 to
12 12:00 instead of the 0902 time.

13 Another thing I became aware of -- this was
14 from a citizen who called this week. That is, our Website
15 does need some updating. Unfortunately, the agenda was not
16 on for February nor was it on an older meeting -- the past
17 meeting of December. So I'm working on that with the folks
18 at the state office. And apparently there is a new system
19 they are using -- anyhow, there are some glitches. If
20 somebody says, hey, there is nothing on the Website, I want
21 you guys to know there is some stuff on the Website and some
22 stuff that's not. So that was good to learn.

23 Another thing, when you go through your
24 packets, we have a schedule of events we have handed out to
25 all of you. And if you will share that with your communities

1 and with who you represent.

2 We also have -- February will be geology month.
3 Tracie Liegler is setting up what she calls monthly themes
4 for interpretation and February is geology. March
5 tentatively will be wild flowers. Tentatively April will be
6 Xeriscaping. And May will be cultural resources. And we
7 will be sending out these monthly programs to you all on your
8 fax numbers, as well as you now have hard copy schedule of
9 events, January through March, but we will be adding stuff as
10 we do these themes.

11 This is our outreach sorts of stuff we are
12 working on. The other thing just to go over, I mailed out to
13 all of you folks was a workshop, forest watershed
14 delineation. That's going to be held in San Bernardino at
15 the San Bernardino National Forest. It's a workshop that
16 Forest Service regionally is sponsoring. And basically what
17 this means is it's a team of folks that go there. It's BLM,
18 Forest Service, Bureau of Reclamation, a group of folks, a
19 cadre from regional and state office level. They have been
20 doing this throughout the state. They put up on the screen
21 water maps, topo maps, and people delineate out their
22 watershed. And so we will have a watershed map for the
23 National Monument is my goal.

24 I have shared it with you and Jim Sullivan,
25 with the interagency folks, I have shared it with Forest

1 Service and BLM folks. What I am working on, if you are
2 going to have a meeting here in San Bernardino, we probably
3 need one day or afternoon or morning that would focus on the
4 National Monument. So if we can work out that date shortly,
5 I'll follow up -- and to the tribe as well -- e-mail to the
6 tribe and everybody else of that date to go and help do this
7 delineation. You would be needing staff folks that are
8 familiar with GIS and your landscape, if you wanted to send
9 folks.

10 Does anybody have any questions on that? Did
11 you guys see that e-mail? Good. Good.

12 What else? I guess just going through the
13 packet, I have handed out -- and Eddy can talk about this at
14 some point -- the closure for Carizzo as well as for Magnesia
15 Springs for dogs. This is California Department of Fish and
16 Games. It will be published, and Eddy can comment further if
17 you have questions.

18 In your packet also, following up from Don Able
19 when he presented to the group on the presentation about the
20 group of folks that work on trails in Juneau, Alaska, we
21 picked up the website for that, and that's in your packet, if
22 you want to take a look at that. It's something that would
23 be really nice to steal when we figure out where all of our
24 trails are going to be.

25 Following up on an action item from the last

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 meeting, in your packet there is a matrix for wilderness.
2 And specifically, it talks about the major landowners within
3 the Monument: California State Park, California Department
4 of Fish and Game, the Tribe, UC Riverside, Deep Canyon,
5 Forest Service, BLM. And the status of wilderness, if
6 wilderness exists, how much. What could be done.

7 We would then suggest, following what we agreed
8 to in the minutes that I reviewed, you would take that back

9 to your cities, the staff, and have it reviewed. And then we
10 can follow up with Buford's proposal of setting up a work
11 group to maybe make a recommendation on the Palm Canyon
12 Wilderness.

13 Then there is the packet for the presentation
14 that I will be giving you guys on just rechartering and
15 looking for a mission from you folks for 2003 and the future.
16 There is a time line. We handed out the time line. I know
17 we have at least one meeting, April's meeting. Here are the
18 adjustments for the Monument plan, and it also shows again
19 the relationships with the CDCA plan, Coachella Valley
20 Multispecies Plan, Ford plan, and the Monument Plan.

21 And the adjustments, I have attached this
22 letter and sent a copy or a letter to -- let me back up. I
23 have attached this time line and sent a letter to Jim Bartel
24 at Carlsbad US Fish and Wildlife Service so that he is aware
25 of the time line and the need for consultation on the

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Monument plan.

2 And the last thing I will go over, because the
3 rest will be Connell's presentation after lunch, is
4 recommendation for management plan consideration. This is a
5 summary from the work that Austin and David did with you all
6 and the work that you did.

7 In the back, as we go over the issues, Connell
8 will do that and she will show you where you can find it with
9 a draft Monument plan when it comes out. That's it, except
10 for thanks for being here and participating.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comments? Thank you,
12 Danella. Let's see. Is Jim Kenna here? There he is, hiding
13 in the back.

14 MR. KENNA: I assume that's the summons to do
15 the agency update.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: You are correct.

17 MR. KENNA: This looks like as good a place as
18 any.

19 Just a couple of quick information items. One,
20 the BLM plan amendment in support of the Multiple Species
21 Plan, the record of decision for that was signed on
22 December 27th. We already have staff working on some of the
23 implementation items, so you will start to see some of that
24 come forward in the next few months.

25 Second item, we had a train derailment several

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 weeks ago out at Windy Point. I'm sure Bary is aware of it.
2 We did have a few incidents there. There were some valuable
3 things, some rods that were spilled off of one of the cars.
4 And so for a period of time there was a guard out. And the
5 guard was helping direct off-highway vehicle use into Windy
6 Point. So we had a little problem there, but we were able to
7 get all of the shifts of all of the guards educated that that
8 was not something we were trying to accomplish and basically
9 got that turned around, and things have restabilized in that
10 regard.

11 Third thing, dog hiking has been in the news
12 quite a bit lately. I will answer any questions anybody
13 wants, but the only thing I was going to say is that don't
14 believe anything that you are reading in terms of conspiracy
15 theories out there. People are actually working together,
16 and I do anticipate that we will be able to get this to some
17 sort of a resolution.

18 Fourth thing: It's also been in the news a
19 little bit. Congresswoman Bono is trying to help parties
20 come together in some closer dialogue relative to long-term
21 sheep strategy or sheep recovery strategy kinds of actions.
22 I think that will be positive, and that should happen over
23 the course of the next month.

24 We will be continuing to work with CVAG and the
25 Mountains Conservancy and the cities and the wildlife

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 agencies to try and take trails plan to the next level. We
2 have -- as you know, we went through a public comment period
3 with the agreements that had been reached to date with the
4 wildlife agencies in terms of alternatives. We received a
5 set of comments on those. We will be doing the comment
6 analysis on that. There will be yet another iteration that
7 will come out as part of the Multi-Species Plan and people
8 will get another shot at it in a draft form. So I think
9 there will be some progress on that front as well.

10 And then the last thing I was going to mention,
11 although there aren't a lot of desert tortoise in the
12 Monument, there are some. And there is quite a bit of work
13 going on right now on the desert tortoise, looking at the
14 effectiveness of some of the conservation measures and the
15 review of the recovery plan. Some of the disease issues that
16 are going on and some of the predation issues that really has
17 come to the fore quite a bit. So I guess that's my
18 information summary, and I'm available for questions.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Could you expand just a
20 little bit on what Bono is doing?

21 MR. KENNA: I'm not sure how much I can expand
22 at this point. I can tell you I have talked with her, and I
23 think her intentions are very good. Her perception -- and I
24 think it's a real perception -- is that the parties involved
25 in sheep conservation in the valley could be working a lot

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 more closely together and the communications could be better.
2 And I think it's her intent to try and help that along. I
3 think it's intended to be a meeting. I don't think I can go
4 much further than that because I'm not sure I know exactly
5 where everything is going to land on that. I just -- that's
6 sort of the general direction, and that's probably as much as
7 I know.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Questions?

9 MR. MORGAN: Are they going to be large public
10 meetings or private meetings?

11 MR. KENNA: My understanding is it's her
12 intent to just get some key people together and talk
13 together. I don't think it's her intent to do a large
14 meeting. But, you know, I have to caveat that a little bit
15 in the sense that I don't work for congresswoman Bono, and
16 she is certainly entitled to create whatever she chooses to
17 create in that regard. And those are going to be her
18 decisions, not mine.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Allan.

20 MR. MUTH: Who is doing the tortoise work?

21 (Inaudible.)

22 MR. KENNA: No. It's much broader than that.

23 It's being done under the auspices of the Desert Managers'

24 Group. If you were going to characterize a lead biologist

25 for it, it's probably Ray Bransfield out of Ventura, a very,
21

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 very good, in my view, very, very good biologist.

2 MR. MUTH: I have known him for many years.

3 MR. KENNA: Phil Metica is certainly involved.

4 So there are some pretty high-powered talent involved in the
5 thing. They are trying to mix together not just the
6 biologists that are really keyed into what is going on and

7 reviewing the data on a day-to-day basis. But also some of
8 the management entities. I know, Fort Irwin has a
9 representative there, for example. Of course, BLM will. So
10 I think the discussion will be fairly broadly based.

11 MR. BOGERT: Frank Bogert.

12 What is the deal on the maintenance of trails?
13 Is the BLM going to maintain them and when and if can they
14 start?

15 MR. KENNA: I guess the answer to that in my
16 view will come out of the interagency multijurisdictional
17 trails management plan. On BLM ground, certainly it makes
18 sense for BLM to do that or be a partner or player in it.
19 But there are many jurisdictions involved with trails in the
20 mountains. The tribes are certainly involved, and they do
21 some maintenance.

22 There are a number of city parcels,
23 particularly where trail heads are. For example, there is
24 stuff at Lake Cahuilla that is county. So I think the

25 reality is -- and I think that's one of the benefits that

22

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 could flow from the trails management plan -- is that all the
2 various jurisdictions could come together on an approach
3 towards maintenance and whether that ends up with one crew
4 that we all hire or a crew underneath one entity that works
5 around all the different jurisdictions or a set of crews.
6 Maybe geographically, south end of the mountains, north end.
7 I think those are yet to be determined. It would be, I
8 presume, part of an implementation agreement related to
9 trails.

10 MR. BOGERT: For years the Desert Riders
11 maintained the trails. Now they are not maintaining them.
12 And the Desert Riders has several hundred thousand dollars in
13 their till. Is there any way they could work with you and
14 use that money and have the Desert Riders maintain them?
15 After the last big rain, the one we had, there are lots of
16 trails going to hell, and they need maintenance now.

17 MR. KENNA: I think that is a possibility to
18 do some sort of cooperative public/private partnership on
19 trail maintenance.

20 MR. BOGERT: Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Frank, is there a name for
22 Jim to contact?

23 MR. KENNA: I'm familiar with them.

24 MR. BOGERT: He knows who they are. A guy

25 died and left us a lot of money, and we don't know what to do
23

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 with it, and it should be used for trail maintenance. Except
2 we can't do it because the Indians are maintaining their
3 trails, which they haven't done, and the BLM is maintaining
4 their trails, which they haven't done. Somebody needs to do
5 something.

6 MR. CRITES: There is work going on on that
7 process, and they are trying to see if the maintenance trails
8 plan can't parallel the speed of the appointments process.

9 (Laughter.)

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other cogent remarks?

11 MR. HAVERT: Bill Havert. On the desert
12 tortoise work, do you know how extensive is it in the
13 Coachella valley?

14 MR. KENNA: Well, its focus is primarily in
15 the DWMAs, not that I mean to use an acronym. But Desert
16 Wildlife Management Areas. Those were identified based on --
17 Al could probably help me out here -- but based on desert
18 tortoise concentrations or groups. And they are all over
19 California and actually in other states, as well.

20 And I think they are going to look at the
21 conservation actions by DWMAs. And one of those spills over
22 into the Chuckwalla Bench. One spills over obviously into
23 the Coachella Valley. The situations in the various
24 locations, there are some very distinct differences in terms

25 of what we know about disease or mortality prevalence or the
24

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 prominence of the one threat or another.

2 And there is also, and I think this is part of
3 the reason for the review, some differences in the history of
4 what has gone on in those particular DWMAs. There are many
5 that haven't -- there are areas that haven't been grazed, for
6 example, for 10 or 15 years. Other areas that still have
7 grazing in them. So there are different land use activities
8 on different parts. And they will be looking at all of that.

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions, comments?

10 Thank you, Jim.

11 Laurie, you are up.

12 MS. ROSENTHAL: Good morning. I'm Laurie
13 Rosenthal, district ranger on the San Jacinto Ranger
14 District, up the hill, San Bernardino National Forest.

15 As you probably all know, the most overwhelming
16 situation that's going on right now is the die-off of trees
17 on the San Bernardino National Forest. It hasn't affected
18 the Monument too much, but it's adjacent to the Monument.
19 And Idyllwild is experiencing the worst drought in recorded
20 history, and we don't see any relief in sight right now,
21 weather wise. I don't know what happened to El Nino.

22 And since November the tree mortality has
23 doubled. We right now on the forest have approximately
24 150,000 acres of dead trees, 40 to 60 percent. If you

25 haven't been up there, it's quite a dramatic situation. It's
25

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 a sea of red trees.

2 What are we doing about it? Well, what we
3 really need is about \$300 million, and we are asking for that
4 from congressional -- from Mary Bono and Jerry Lewis out of
5 San Bernardino County. We need that because if we just
6 continue to make this a really long-term, slow-moving
7 disaster, we could be seeing a more -- a fire. Basically, a
8 catastrophic fire. I don't mean to be a damper on this
9 already damper day. But this is the reality.

10 What we are doing -- of course, you do what you
11 can with limited resources. What we are doing is that we --
12 we have six contracts out right now. One is to work on a
13 fuel break around the community. And then we have other
14 pockets of areas that are adjacent to the community. Of
15 course, the community safety is the most important thing so
16 we are focusing on the areas near the community with the dead
17 trees.

18 We also are doing hazard tree abatement, which
19 means we are trying to get rid of the trees for emergency
20 evacuations up there. We might end up in a fire season by
21 next month at the rate we are going right now.

22 We have also created an interagency
23 organization that is similar to the ICF, Incident Command

24 Unit you would have on a fire or other disaster situations.
25 This is called MAST; that's the acronym that stands for

26

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Mountain Area Safety Taskforce. There is one in Riverside
2 County and one created in San Bernardino County, as well.
3 And these groups are doing everything from assessing the
4 finances to getting ready for disaster preparedness, et
5 cetera, so that's happening as well.

6 Lastly, our Regional Forester is coming down on
7 Monday to meet with us and assess the area and the damage.
8 And maybe we can even come up with an even better strategy,
9 and of course, we are going to plead for money and
10 assistance. What we really need to do is gear up and get
11 about 10 or 20 times the people we have right now to start
12 working on thinning the forest, basically, for this
13 situation.

14 Also, Congressman Lewis over in San Bernardino
15 and Mary Bono are working -- she has come up and had a tour,
16 and they are working together to try to get some money from
17 congress. Any questions on that?

18 MR. LYMAN: Is there anything that, given
19 those constraints through the land development process up
20 there that we should be aware of or any of those type of
21 things? Obviously it sounds that as new cabins are being
22 built and everything, the ground should be cleared or things
23 like that. Are there things we should look at?

24 MS. ROSENTHAL: As far as making sure there
25 are no dead trees on the private property?

27

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. LYMAN: Yes, or if development continues
2 up, if there is going to be an ongoing issue.

3 MS. ROSENTHAL: Yes. In fact, I just saw this
4 in the paper -- I saw it actually in the national paper, USA
5 Today is lake Arrowhead right now has given residents 30 days
6 to clear all their dead trees. This issue has so many
7 aspects to it. We have private homeowners that don't have
8 \$10,000 to contract out to get rid of their dead tress. So
9 this is -- the state is going to possibly try to help us with
10 this. But so far, emergency services has not really been --
11 they are waiting for the fire, I think, for the -- they
12 pretty much said, we don't know what to do with a drought.
13 This would be setting a precedence.

14 So what we really wanted to do -- and I'm
15 speaking for the whole MAST group right now -- was to declare
16 this a state of emergency. If you declare it a state of
17 emergency, then you are open for national FEMA funds. The
18 best I could say right now is that each homeowner has to take
19 responsibility, and that includes new homes that are being
20 built and everything.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions?

22 MR. KELLNER: Mike Kellner, Agua Caliente.

23 You mentioned that 10 to 20 more people to thin the forest or

24 groups.

25 MS. ROSENTHAL: I said times the amount of

28

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 staff we have right now.

2 MR. KELLNER: What is the plan right now? Is
3 there a plan for thinning in areas besides the community,
4 firebreak or --

5

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Mike, speak up, please.

7 MS. ROSENTHAL: We actually are hiring a
8 vegetation management team. This will only be three people.
9 So again, we want to gear up. But the plan is to make this
10 return to a healthy forest which is back to presettlement
11 conditions where it was more of a parklike situation. It
12 wasn't overstocked like it is today. When you take out fire
13 from ecosystem and you don't cut, this is the result.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Barry.

15 MR. FREET: It's my understanding that you
16 have not found an economic value to the lumber.

17 MS. ROSENTHAL: There again, it's another
18 aspect of this very complicated issue. The mill is 300 miles
19 away, the closest mill. We are in the process of looking for
20 avenues for what to do with all the excess wood. And
21 frankly, like those pines are not even a valuable commodity,
22 so this is another area we are all gearing up for. So this
23 isn't part of this meeting, but if you have any ideas in the

24 long-term how to help us with this, please, get in touch with
25 me or somebody else from my staff.

29

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions?

2 MR. BOGERT: Frank Bogert. How does this

3 process go? Does a dead tree contaminate the other dead
4 trees? You want to cut down any dead trees you have in an
5 area?

6 MS. ROSENTHAL: Eventually the trees are going
7 to fall, and that's even going to be a worse situation as far
8 as a fire hazard. Once a tree is dead, it helps the other
9 trees around it so they are not competing anymore. So
10 actually, this is a positive thing that the forest is
11 naturally thinning itself. If there wasn't a community
12 there, it probably would just be a good thing eventually, but
13 what we have right now with an adjacent community is there is
14 not going to be -- it's not going to be just a slow, cool
15 fire that we are talking about. I'm not sure if I am
16 answering your question. But when the tree dies, it actually
17 does help the trees around it.

18 MR. BOGERT: What I am asking, is it a bug
19 that eats the trees that goes from that tree to the other
20 trees --

21 MS. ROSENTHAL: Yes.

22 MR. BOGERT: So if you had a dead tree, you

23 should cut it down so the bugs don't go to the other guy's?

24 MS. ROSENTHAL: There is a lot of controversy
25 on that. Our entomologist says if you cut the tree down,

30

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 that's probably not going to help the problem. What's really
2 going to help the problem is to get the forest back to being
3 healthy. The bugs are just a symptom of the drought right
4 now.

5 MR. FREET: My comments have already been
6 made, thanks.

7

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anyone else. Bill?

9 MR. HAVERT: How different is it as it gets to
10 higher elevations? Is the situation dramatically better?

11 MS. ROSENTHAL: Yes, it is, because there is
12 more moisture up there. And you have more of a mixed conifer
13 up there. In the higher wilderness, it's definitely a more
14 healthy situation, but that's right now. If we continue on
15 with this drought, these trees need water, and they are
16 dependent on it.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other question? Yes,
18 Buford.

19 MR. CRITES: Buford Crites. I just noted that
20 at 8500 feet on Santa Rosa, there is significant dieoff, so
21 you have to get a long way up.

22 MS. ROSENTHAL: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Not too long ago, you closed
24 the forest. Then you reopened it again when we had our
25 abbreviated El Nino. What's the possibility? Are you going

31

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 to close it again?

2 MS. ROSENTHAL: There is a good possibility if
3 things don't change, that the safety of the community is of
4 the utmost importance. What I am going to be doing in the
5 next month or so is getting a task force together, people
6 from the community, to look at how we can work together on
7 this.

8 If we do have a closure, our biggest concern
9 would be the tourism industry that is so dependent up there.
10 And there are other communities like in New Mexico and
11 Arizona that do forest closures on a regular basis. Being
12 proactive, such as marketing, and saying the forest is closed
13 but the community is open and safe, those are the kinds of
14 proactive sorts of things that we are going to be looking at.

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: It would just seem to me
16 that you have the problem now. And you are not -- you don't
17 have any way to solve it at the moment. And it would seem to
18 me that you would want to close it now and not look at it
19 anymore. The problem is there, the danger is there, and then
20 start talking about how the communities are open and close it
21 because if it burns up, then it's permanent closure.

22 MS. ROSENTHAL: Exactly.

23 MR. MUTH: Just in clarification, when you
24 talk about returning the forest to presettlement condition,
25 is there an area around the habitation, the villages and such
32

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 up there, or are you talking rangewide, the whole forest?

2 MS. ROSENTHAL: The whole forest. The
3 wilderness is probably not the area we are going to be
4 focusing on the most.

5 MR. MUTH: That's a massive logging project on
6 difficult terrain.

7 MS. ROSENTHAL: It might involve helicopter
8 logging as well.

9 MR. MUTH: Which increases your cost by a
10 factor of 10, 20?

11 MS. ROSENTHAL: I don't know what the
12 proportion is,.

13 MR. WATTS: Gary Watts, State Parks.

14 I want to commend you for including us last
15 time when you had the forest closure last time, consulting
16 with us. And I would encourage you, as you speak about your
17 efforts, to include not only us, but also the tram folks as
18 they are affected by any forced closure, as well. And once
19 again, thank you for talking to us to make sure we are part
20 of the process. I know some of the other processes that are
21 going on, for some reason we have been left out of the mix.
22 Whether we are just small potatoes as far as hundreds of

23 people go, or whatever, that's fine and dandy. But some of
24 the considerations should be inclusive.

25 And I think what Laurie is talking about and

33

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 the health of the forest just illustrates how important our
2 management plan is for the Monument when it comes to fire
3 planning. There are no artificial boundaries just because
4 different agencies own different lands up there. We all
5 have to be looking at the potential catastrophic fire
6 capability across the entire Monument as well as beyond that.
7 That's why I'm proud of the plan having that type of
8 contingency in it to include everyone as part of the overall
9 planning effort.

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: There will be a fire plan
11 coming out of the Monument plan or as an addendum. It's
12 going to be after; right? But it will happen within the next
13 year, I would imagine.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Jeff.

15 MR. MORGAN: Proposed closures -- I guess when
16 you did it last year, you just did a blanket closure over the
17 whole forest. Maybe a consideration of different elevations,
18 where the risk is greater to close, say, west of Highway 243
19 first and maybe both sides of Highway 74 as it comes up from
20 Hemet where the real or the greatest danger appears to be and
21 maybe leave the higher elevations above Idyllwild through the
22 wilderness to Mt. San Jacinto later. Staging it so you are

23 not shutting everybody out.

24 MS. ROSENTHAL: Exactly. Would you like to be
25 on this committee?

34

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. MORGAN: We supposedly have a
2 representative.

3 MS. ROSENTHAL: This would be a new committee.

4 MR. MORGAN: I mean Idyllwild.

5 MS. ROSENTHAL: You are talking about from the
6 Sierra Club?

7 MR. MORGAN: Yes.

8 MS. ROSENTHAL: That's true. Those are some
9 of the things we will be looking at. The biggest concern is
10 evacuation. If you don't know where people are. And we are
11 talking about fire behavior that the fire gods that have
12 careers 35, 40 years have never seen fire behavior like this.
13 So human lives is the most important thing, and we want to
14 err on the side of caution. But, yes, we want to look at all
15 the different options out there rather than just a blanket
16 closure.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella.

18 MS. GEORGE: Laurie, has the region or PSW or
19 the forest developed a website regarding the fire problem for
20 the public?

21 MS. ROSENTHAL: I don't believe so, Danella.
22 We don't have a webmaster on our forest right now. We are

23 having a staff retreat on Sunday, a staff retreat, so I will
24 bring that up.

25 MS. GEORGE: That would be really helpful,

35

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 because if folks could see those photos -- I wish we could
2 fly everybody on this advisory committee over that mountain
3 range. Really, they would have an appreciation of what is
4 going on.

5 And the other question is, Do you know or can
6 you ask on Sunday if there is a map or photo available that
7 we can utilize for the briefing with the Regional Forester
8 just so we can show that relationship with the Monument plan.

9 MS. ROSENTHAL: To the --

10 MS. GEORGE: Really hot spots of the dieoff
11 and the red trees. And that relationship with the Monument
12 plan.

13 MS. ROSENTHAL: Actually, we do have lots of
14 photos and everything. John Ratherberger is the person to
15 contact on that.

16 MS. GEORGE: Okay. Thank you.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments, questions?
18 Thank you very much.

19 MS. ROSENTHAL: I do have just one more,
20 believe it or not. There is something totally outside of
21 what we were just talking about. As far as the forest

22 planning goes, we will be having an open house on
23 February 27th at Pine Springs Ranch in Garner Valley from 7
24 to 9 p.m. What we are going to be doing at that open house
25 is laying out the alternatives of the forest plan. There

36

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 will be stations that are set up according to places. We are
2 doing place-based management. And one of the places is the
3 Monument. So we invite you all to attend that. It should be
4 a very interesting evening. And if you need directions you
5 can call the district office at 909, 659-2117.

6 MR. HAVERT: Did you say the 27th?

7 MS. ROSENTHAL: 27th. It's a Thursday
8 evening.

9 MR. KELLNER: The name of the building again?

10 MS. ROSENTHAL: Pine Springs Ranch. It's an
11 organizational ranch. It's right off of Apple Canyon Road.
12 And unfortunately on the way down, my Jeep had this sign that
13 said "engine problem," so I'm on my way to the Jeep dealer
14 now because they are only open this morning. But I should be
15 back this afternoon. Any other questions?

16 MS. HENDERSON: If you are not, we will know
17 why.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very much.

19 Let me just say that the letter we wrote to the
20 Regional Manager of US Fish and Game and the Wildlife
21 Conservation Board, I want to thank Bill Havert for that. He

22 was the author. Many of you are saying, "That's a great job,
23 Ed." It was a great job, Bill. I want to thank you very
24 much for that.

25 MR. CRITES: There is a response to it. This
37

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 one came from a letter CVAG sent that says they are not doing
2 it.

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Okay. Let's see.
4 Department of Fish and Game has received your letter
5 regarding the exchange of department proposed by Tim
6 Blixseth. The department has decided to retain all fee title
7 interests in Magnesia Spring Ecological Reserve. The
8 attached letter to Mr. Blixseth provides the department's
9 position. Thank you, thank you, thank you.

10 Thank you very much, Buford, appreciate that.
11 Jeff, you can cross that one off your worry list.

12 MR. MORGAN: I will remove it from my -- thank
13 you.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Off the record for just a
15 moment.

16 (Discussion was held off the record.)

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: BLM Interim Monument Trails
18 Management. Rachelle Huddleston-Lorton.

19 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: There is a
20 little-bitty slide presentation I have going. I will
21 introduce myself. I'm Rachelle Huddleston-Lorton. I'm a

22 wildlife biologist for the BLM in Palm Springs, with nearly a
23 decade of Bighorn sheep management all over the Western
24 United States. So primarily my duties in the Monument relate
25 to Bighorn sheep management and just about anything else they

38

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 would like to throw at me.

2 As Jim Kenna mentioned earlier, we finished our
3 Coachella Valley Plan Amendment. In December, we got a
4 biological opinion from the Fish and Wildlife Service on our
5 Interim Trails Management Plan that we had proposed when we
6 initiated consultation. So what that leaves us with, our
7 terms and conditions that are different from the stipulations
8 in the CDC lawsuit. So I thought what I would do this
9 morning is take you through a brief overview of what our
10 Interim Trails Management Plan is now, not forgetting that
11 ultimately we will have a Multiple Jurisdictions and Inter-
12 Agency Trails Management Plan as part of the Multiple Species
13 Plan. And Katie Barrows is going to take us through that.

14 Just page down, Connell.

15 It's very similar to the last two years when we
16 were under the lawsuit. There are a few changes. The list
17 of trails has changed, and as part of that we have redone the
18 brochure. Basically what we did is made up a little list of
19 trails, and this is on the table out front. It says which
20 trails are open during the voluntary trail avoidance period.
21 And on the back it shows what trails are still on the

22 voluntary trail avoidance program.

23 What we are asking our staff on the trails to
24 do is to take this, slip it inside the Monument brochure, and
25 hand it out to the public that they contact at the trail

39

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 heads. The message they are giving them in terms of
2 interacting with the public is the same: We are asking
3 people to voluntarily refrain from using these certain lists
4 of trails during the lambing period and also a small list of
5 trails during the hot season to protect the current sheep
6 during that season from disturbance.

7 We have got a staff of five recreation
8 technicians that are on board during the sheep season. They
9 are out there communicating with the public the need to try
10 and reduce disturbance to sheep during the sensitive periods.
11 And then the rest of the year we will be using them for
12 monitoring in other places on the Monument and also in other
13 places in the resource area.

14 This is a list of trails that you have in your
15 hand. The brochure, some of these are on BLM land, some of
16 them are not. Trails of Big Morongo -- just to give people
17 an idea there are places both within and outside of the
18 Monument available for hiking and equestrian and mountain
19 biking use.

20 The voluntary trail avoidance program from
21 January 1 through June 30, this is the list of trail under

22 the voluntary closure. Skyline Trail has an asterisk because
23 it was a trail that was added by the Fish and Wildlife
24 Service to our biological opinion. It's not a trail that we
25 had proposed when we initiated consultation as part of these

40

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 interim measures. The Fish and Wildlife Service added that
2 because they feel that because the San Jacinto population of
3 Bighorn sheep is so imperiled right now they would like for
4 us to be monitoring trail use here, just to kind of get a
5 baseline feel for how many people are using this trail during
6 the lambing season.

7 The types of information that the ambassadors
8 are collecting is very similar to what it's been in the past:
9 The numbers of people they contact, the number of people with
10 dogs, the number of people on mountain bikes or equestrians
11 to kind of continue that baseline data collection we have
12 been doing for two years. The Boohoff has two asterisks
13 because it doesn't include that Morrow Trail link between La
14 Quinta Cove and Lake Cahuilla. That trail is still open.

15 With respect to dogs, we are still operating
16 under the January 2000 Federal Register notice that closed
17 all public trails east of Palm Canyon to dogs except for the
18 two areas identified, Cathedral City Cove and La Quinta Cove.

19 Then during the hot season, so July 1st up
20 through September 30, Art Smith, Dunn Road, Bear Creek
21 Canyon, Bear Creek Oasis, Guadalupe and Boohoff trails are

22 under this voluntary avoidance program where we ask people to
23 please avoid using these trails so the Bighorn sheep can find
24 water during the dry season.

25 MS. HENDERSON: That's different than what

41

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 this card has shown.

2 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: Art Smith, Dunn Road,
3 Bear Creek Canyon. Oh, it's the second list of trails.

4 MS. HENDERSON: I understand that. But the
5 first list is showing the Boohoff with a double asterisk.

6 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: I added the double
7 asterisk when I put this together. I didn't identify on this
8 card that Skyline was added by the Fish and Wildlife Service.
9 I wanted to point that out to you because when we initiated
10 that, we didn't include the Skyline Trail. They added that.
11 That's a trail that wasn't part of our initial proposed
12 action to the Service.

13 MS. HENDERSON: Right. In the second list,
14 Boohoff Trail has the asterisk and your list up there does
15 not.

16 THE WITNESS: Same thing, here and here.
17 Essentially, it's one of those late night Power Point
18 presentations. This does not include the Morrow Trail
19 portion of the Boohoff.

20 MS. HENDERSON: That's what the asterisks

21 says.

22 THE WITNESS: That's what the asterisk says is
23 that it does not include the link between La Quinta Cove and
24 the Morrow Trail.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So the card is correct?

42

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: The card is correct.
2 And this is an asterisk issue here. The list of trails is
3 the same. And that's it.

4 So if you all have any questions, I would be
5 happy to field any. And if not, I will turn it over to Katie
6 Barrows. She is going to give you an update on the Trails
7 Management Plan, and I will stick around in case you have any
8 questions related to that.

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Jeff?

10 MR. MORGAN: I am familiar with these trails
11 and I know where these trails are. But a visitor to the area
12 might not, just giving them a list of named trails. Maybe
13 you need a map.

14 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: There are maps
15 available at the Visitors' Center.

16 MR. MORGAN: That show it all?

17 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: The trails map we have
18 been using for the last several years.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Another question?

20 MR. WOODS: I have attended -- John Woods,

21 Alpine Village. I have attended a lot of the meetings over
22 the year regarding the Bighorn sheep with the issues with the
23 Monument. And this is a little bit new to me. I don't know
24 if I missed something in the past, but the issues about the
25 hot season. My understanding is on the trails closure is

43

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 that originally, voluntary or otherwise, that they were
2 primarily related to lambing issues. And now you have five
3 trails up there only open in terms of voluntary use three
4 months out of the year, one-quarter of the year. When did
5 the issue of the hot season come about? I'm unaware of it
6 totally.

7 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: The hot season has
8 been an issue even prior for the CDC lawsuit, but it was part
9 of the stipulation of the lawsuit. BLM initiated a
10 consultation with Fish and Wildlife Service in January of
11 2000. We included interim measures to protect Bighorn sheep
12 during that hot season because water is so scarce in these
13 mountains, they have to traverse a larger area than they
14 might during the winter when there is a lot more water
15 available. It's going to spread them out, and we wanted to
16 ensure that these trails where we know there are existing
17 water sources, Tenajas, Thermal Springs, that sheep are
18 protected during that period so they have an opportunity to
19 get to those water sources without being disturbed.

20 So it's not new from the standpoint of BLM's

21 interim management or even management under the lawsuit for
22 the last couple of years. So that's what we have been doing.
23 But again, it's voluntary. We are asking people to give them
24 a little bit of space.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella.

44

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. GEORGE: Eddy Kono to go first. He has
2 his hand up.

3 MR. KONO: Eddy Kono. California Department
4 of Fish and Game. I would also like to say that there are
5 regulations, California state regulations, that close our Eco
6 Reserve during that hot season from July 1 through
7 September 30th.

8 MR. WOODS: When you say the Eco Reserve,
9 could you point it out on a map of identify it for us?

10 MR. KONO: It's Carizzo Ecological Reserve.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Perhaps in the audience,
12 when you ask questions or speak, you will stand up to help
13 the reporter.

14 MR. KONO: Carizzo Reserve is located along
15 Highway 74. It's to the west, between -- it's approximately
16 from the Royal Carizzo gate south to where the Art Smith
17 trailhead is.

18 MR. HAVERT: It would be north.

19 MR. KONO: North, I'm sorry. To the Art Smith

20 trailhead. And then Magnesia Springs Eco Reserve is located
21 near -- it's in Rancho Mirage area. Out here.

22 MR. MORGAN: You can see it out the window.

23 MR. KONO: Those areas are closed by law
24 during the hot season.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella.

45

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. GEORGE: I just wanted to say on the
2 record that Rachelle has worked diligently on the CDCA Plan
3 Amendment with all the sheep work. She will be contributing
4 with the trails plan. She will be the BLM's chief biologist.
5 She has been helping us with the Monument plan, with all
6 sorts of biological aspects, but particularly sheep. And she
7 was recruited because of her expertise in Bighorn sheep and
8 her dedication and her professionalism. And we just greatly
9 appreciate you, Rachelle. Thanks for coming today so people
10 know who you are.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions, comments,
12 before Rachelle leaves us? Thank you very much.

13 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: Thank you.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Update of the Coachella
15 Valley Multispecies Plan, Katie.

16 MS. BARROWS: I have a brief summary for you.
17 Any of the old-fashioned types, I have a paper copy available
18 of the trail map. If you like, I will pass this around.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: A suggestion. Let's not

20 pass it around until your presentation is over. Last time
21 there was so much noise from the map folding and unfolding,
22 we couldn't hear. Please introduce yourself, Katie, for the
23 record.

24 MS. BARROWS: Mr. Chairman, I appreciate the
25 opportunity to join you this morning. I'm Katie Barrows, the
46

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 associate director of the Coachella Mountains Conservancy.
2 As you might know, the Conservancy has been very involved as
3 a state agency in working to acquire land in the Santa Rosa
4 Mountains and other mountains in the Coachella Valley. And
5 we are involved with the Coachella Valley Association of
6 Governments, actually working with them to prepare the
7 Multiple Species Plan.

8 So what I wanted to do today is give you a
9 little update on where things stand in regard to the trails
10 portion of this rather long and sometimes arduous planning
11 effort. Buford, what did you say about the appointment
12 process? I think we've got you beat, but we are getting
13 there.

14 Basically what I want to do is show you a
15 little bit about what is going on with the trails plan. As
16 you may know, this plan, as I mentioned, is being prepared as
17 one element of the Coachella Valley Multiple Species Plan
18 under the lead of CVAG, the Coachella Valley Association of
19 Governments. This is a multi-jurisdictional plan, as Jim and

20 Rachelle have already described. The focus is not only that
21 BLM, which has significant lands in the mountain, would be a
22 significant partner, but also all the other state and federal
23 agencies and the local jurisdictions. Many of the cities, of
24 course, have land that provides access to trails and trails
25 that are included within their city limits.

47

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 This is a plan that we expect to be adaptive.
2 In other words, we want to begin by describing a proposed
3 trails plan. And as we gain more data, more information
4 about trail use and about Bighorn sheep use, we will adapt
5 and change that. So some of the prescriptions we are talking
6 about today may not be permanent. We hope to really develop
7 that adaptive approach to managing the Monument as well as
8 the trails that are within it.

9 I know I have mentioned this in previous
10 presentations, but our goal for this plan is twofold: One,
11 to ensure the recovery of the Peninsula Bighorn sheep; and
12 two, to provide reasonable access to the public on a
13 year-round basis to trails for all the different ways trails
14 could be used. So over the years, we have been working
15 together with really a large group of folks, a working group
16 with representatives from the trails community and many of
17 the cities have been very, very active partners in this
18 effort to come up with a Trails Plan.

19 And at this time we have a range of

20 alternatives, as Jim mentioned, in the CDCA Plan Amendment.
21 That Trails Plan was presented to the public. The public was
22 given an opportunity to make comments, but the actual
23 decision-making process in terms of this plan is within the
24 Multiple Species Plan. I will talk a little bit more about
25 that in just a few minutes.

48

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Basically, we do have a range of alternatives,
2 but there has been, at least through BLM's process, a
3 preferred alternative identified. And I'm going to focus on
4 that. You could obtain I believe a copy -- is that still
5 available? There is a Trails Plan, a condensed version from
6 the CDCA Amendment that BLM has, and if any of you don't have
7 that or you would like to read the detail, you could obtain a
8 copy of that.

9 So this shows you the area that we are
10 concerned with. And this Trails Plan does focus on the Santa
11 Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains. Here is the Windy Point
12 area, Interstate 10, so we are looking basically at the
13 entire Monument area shown here. The Palm Springs, Windy
14 Point. Here's the City of Palm Springs, the City of Rancho
15 Mirage, Palm Desert, Highway 74, La Quinta down here, and
16 down to the border, down here to the county line.

17 What we have done in this process -- and I have
18 just kind of summarized with regard to the Trails Plan --
19 there are several elements to this plan. What you are seeing

20 here in blue shows that area that is the Bighorn sheep
21 habitat. And within that, we have done several things.
22 Earlier on we were focused on the individual trails. And now
23 in the Trails Plan what we are looking at are seasonal trail
24 areas established. And within these seasonal trail areas,
25 those would be places where some trail closures could occur

49

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 as a result of the same issues Rachelle talked about.
2 Lambing, providing protection for sensitive lambing areas,
3 January 15th to the summer, and then during that hot season
4 period, from July 1 to September 30th, additional closures
5 could occur in order to provide sheep access to water.

6 So what I want to do is focus on -- in addition
7 to the seasonal trail areas, there are existing trails that
8 would be available for year-round use. And I'm not going to
9 go through a list of those trails, but I did attach on pages
10 3 and 4, actually, the back and front of what would be the
11 second and third page, a list of those trails that are in the
12 plan proposed for year-around use. And it's very similar to
13 the list -- I'm not sure if there are any differences,
14 actually, between the list of the current interim management
15 and what's proposed.

16 So this list shows us the trails available for
17 year-round use under the proposed Trails Plan we are working
18 on now. And likewise, on page 4, seasonal trail areas and
19 trails that are proposed for closure, both during the

20 sensitive lambing period from January 15 to June 30th, and
21 also during the access to water in the summer period.

22 Another element of the plan in addition to
23 those seasonal trail areas is one of the things that we have
24 looked at is can we provide new opportunities for hiking that
25 don't affect the sheep habitat in the same way as some of our
50

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 existing trails might? And that involves new trails and
2 perimeter trails. And we have a very active group of folks
3 that have been working over the last several months to look
4 at where we can establish perimeter trails.

5 Actually this concept -- I have been around for
6 a very long time working on the mountain stuff. And I know
7 this is something we had the idea of, perimeter trails, view
8 of the valley and hike along the mountains kind of approach.

9 What I want to show you is some of the efforts
10 in terms of those perimeter trails.

11 Starting in the Palm Springs area, Palm
12 Springs, Cathedral City, we are looking at a number of trails
13 here. This is one that you can see in the purple, this
14 purple line. This is the Cathedral City Cove area. And we
15 are looking to establish a trail that would basically go
16 right around the perimeter of that Cathedral City cove,
17 partially on BLM land and partially on City of Rancho Mirage
18 land. On this trail has been -- we have trail builder Mike

19 Schuler going out and walking these trails. And we have been
20 working very closely with the wildlife biologists, Rachelle,
21 Eddy, (inaudible) from Fish and Game and Guy Wagner from Fish
22 and Wildlife Service. And over the last several months, a
23 lot of hiking has been going on. So we are getting out and
24 actually looking to make sure these trails are reasonable
25 with respect to both hiking opportunities and Bighorn sheep

51

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 habitat.

2 One element of this perimeter trails program is
3 we have to do an environmental review process. And we are in
4 the midst of initiating cultural resource studies that would
5 look at that, and that's being done with significant help of
6 BLM and Wanda Raschkow from their staff. And also looking at
7 what the biological effects would be with regard to sheep,
8 actually desert tortoise is another species that does occur
9 in our mountains. And actually, looking at the visual
10 impacts of any potential trail construction.

11 I should mention and I will show you this
12 again. But basically, in addition to the Cathedral City
13 trail, there is some discussion in the City of Rancho Mirage
14 about the possibility of a trail being developed in this
15 area. This is adjacent to the Lodge Hotel, which is right
16 here. And as a result of the fence that's been installed to
17 prevent sheep from getting out into the residential areas and
18 the highway, there is an area here which could potentially

19 provide an opportunity for a short hiking trail that doesn't
20 impact sheep habitat at all.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: On the Cathedral City trail,
22 it would appear it's all toe of slope except right at the
23 south end of it. You get some elevation there?

24 MS. BARROWS: Yes, it's actually about --
25 above the toe of the slope. It's about at 400, 600 feet in
52

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 elevation. It goes right around the edge of the cove, but it
2 is in the mountains. That answered your question?

3 MR. FREET: And the proposed use would be
4 hiking only?

5 MS. BARROWS: We haven't completely discussed
6 all of the possibilities, but a general approach with these
7 trails is that they be usable by any trail user, whether it's
8 hiking -- I'm not sure in this case whether the mountain
9 biking opportunities would be appropriate. We are looking at
10 all the trails being available for mountain bikes,
11 equestrians and hikers.

12 MS. HENDERSON: Just to clarify or make sure,
13 what you are showing us today is not necessarily on the map
14 that I have.

15 MS. BARROWS: That's right.

16 MS. HENDERSON: This is dated July 18 and this
17 would be dated -- is it updated?

18 MS. BARROWS: This one is as of January,

19 basically. If you are interested, we can get you an updated
20 copy that has that permanent in it.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Frank.

22 MR. BOGERT: You show on your thing the North
23 Likken Trail open. Our yellow sheet from Rachelle shows it
24 closed. Why don't you get together?

25 MS. BARROWS: Rachelle, can I ask for your

53

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 assistance on that question? What I should point out is that
2 the list that's on the card, the yellow card, is the current
3 management. And the list that I gave you is what's proposed.
4 And I'm not sure in that case -- are we still looking at the
5 North Likken Trail?

6 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: It would be a
7 year-round open trail with respect to the Trails Management
8 Plan that Katie is discussing. However, when BLM initiated
9 consultation with the Fish and Wildlife Service in January of
10 2000, we gave them a list of trails that are -- just the
11 parts on BLM land, of course, that we would put under this
12 interim management of seasonal voluntary avoidance program.
13 So that's why there is a difference between what's on the
14 yellow card and what has been worked out on the Trails
15 Management Plan because we have had time in the last couple
16 of years in working with the Trails Program in trying to come
17 up with this plan with the cities and the wildlife agencies
18 to modify that list somewhat. So that's why the list is not

19 exactly the same.

20 MR. BOGERT: The North Likken Trail is pretty
21 much a perimeter trail. Why would you be closing it in the
22 first place?

23 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: That's a very good
24 question. Why would we close it? I wasn't here when we
25 initiated consultation. That was before my time with BLM.

54

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Jim Kenna says it came out of the recovery team at that time.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Jeff.

3 MR. MORGAN: There is another thing about the
4 North Likken Trail. Two points to make here. One is it's
5 only about 100 yards on the BLM land. The rest is on city or
6 private land. Only a small amount is on BLM land. It's
7 mostly a private or city land, so there is no jurisdiction.
8 But the other point was I believe it was the intent to leave
9 the North Likken Trail to stay open from its southerly
10 trailhead as far as the picnic tables where the Skyline Trail
11 takes off and don't allow continued use in the lambing season
12 into Tacheva Canyon, which is a large sheep-use area.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anyone else?

14 MS. BARROWS: Does that answer all those
15 questions?

16 Another focus in terms of a possible perimeter
17 trail we are looking at is connecting this proposed trail
18 around Cathedral City Cove over to Palm Springs. We have not

19 yet been able to establish how that might work. There are
20 some Indian lands, there are some private lands, there are
21 some complications to that. So we are continuing to work on
22 that possibility. But at this time we haven't got it on the
23 map as a proposed perimeter trail.

24 Moving down valley to the Rancho Mirage, Palm
25 Desert area, here is Highway 74 right here. This is the

55

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Magnesia Cove and Rancho Mirage located right here. Part of
2 this perimeter trail concept is to the extent possible, we
3 wanted to create trail connections that would go along the
4 perimeter, really, from one city to the next, if we can do
5 that. So we are looking from the Rancho Mirage area, there
6 is an existing trail here, this blue trail called the Mirage
7 trail or better known as the "bump and grind trail," it's an
8 extremely popular trail people use for their cardiovascular
9 workout. Very short but gives a good burst up the hill and
10 down.

11 One concern with that trail is it does go into
12 some of the land owned by Fish and Game and Magnesia Springs
13 ecological reserve, so we are looking at whether there might
14 be a possibility of changing the alignment of that trail
15 slightly. But at this time that trail is proposed to
16 continue to be open. We are looking at whether there is a
17 possibility to connect that trail to another system of

18 perimeter trails now being worked on by the City of Palm
19 Desert, and those are what are being called as the Homme
20 Adams trail system shown here in purple. The City has some
21 property recently acquired and an additional piece of
22 property in this area that was recently acquired through a
23 cooperative effort between the City of Palm Desert, with help
24 from the BLM and the Mountains Conservancy.

25 The City does have trail plans for several

56

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 perimeter trails in this area, and if we can connect those to
2 the bump and grind trail in Rancho Mirage, that would be our
3 ultimate goal.

4 We also want to connect this Homme Adams trail
5 to a trail that would basically wrap around -- this is the

6 Bighorn Golf Club here on the west side of Highway 74 and the
7 Cahuilla Hills area. And we are looking at connecting a
8 trail from Homme Adams around the back of that area here -- I
9 didn't drink any coffee this morning so that's why I'm
10 shaking so much. That would come around to Highway 74 in the
11 Cat Canyon area. So we have an opportunity for folks to just
12 really go right behind Cahuilla Hills, come to Highway 74.
13 The Monument Visitor's Center is located right here. So that
14 is also a perimeter trail we are now hiking to make sure we
15 can find the correct route.

16 Continuing from there, another perimeter trail
17 that would go from the Monument Visitors' Center right here

18 up to the ridgeline, this is involving some City of Palm
19 Desert and BLM lands and would provide a nice view
20 opportunity. It's quite amazing that there is a little trail
21 behind the Visitors' Center almost existing. You can go into
22 a canyon and Highway 74 virtually disappears, you don't even
23 hear the noise. And it's really remarkable that that close,
24 there is a nice trail opportunity there. So this is another
25 perimeter trail.

57

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Additional to that in the new trail category,
2 there has been a longstanding effort to try to look for a
3 trail that would connect Palm Desert to La Quinta. And I'm
4 going to talk about that in just a few minutes. I want to
5 continue with a perimeter trail concept. This is the La
6 Quinta Cove here. This is the La Quinta Resort, and we are
7 looking at a couple of short perimeter trails. What we find
8 for many people is the hiking experience or the trail
9 experience is maybe sometimes just a short one- to two-hour
10 opportunity, so we have a short trail here in this part of La
11 Quinta, the north end of the Cove that we are looking at that
12 basically gets up to an elevation with a view. And likewise,
13 another short trail of the same nature here in the
14 southeastern end of the Cove on existing BLM land. And we
15 are meeting next week with the City staff and the agency
16 biologist to take a look at those alignments.

17 One other proposed perimeter trail that we

18 don't show on the map is one that would connect from the Lake
19 Cahuilla right here down to -- I will show it to you on
20 another slide -- but down to the Martinez Canyon area.

21 I want to point out several of the trails that
22 have been discussed. This is the Boohoff trail area in La
23 Quinta and many of these blue lines are existing trails
24 subject to seasonal closures. The one trail that would
25 continue to be open in La Quinta area is the Morrow Trail,

58

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 which is the hike from La Quinta Cove to Lake Cahuilla right
2 here. If we can tie that into a future trail system, we will
3 have another opportunity.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any questions on this slide?

5 MR. KELLNER: What happened to Indian Wells?
6 Any trail systems through Indian Wells?

7 MS. BARROWS: Quite honestly, there hasn't
8 been a lot of interest on the part of the City of Indian
9 Wells for trails. Most of this area here is various country
10 club land, and a fair portion of the mountainous lands
11 immediately south of those are owned by the country clubs,
12 and there hasn't been a great deal of interest on the part of
13 those clubs to encourage trails in that area.

14 It also, as you might be aware, is a fairly
15 significantly rugged area, but we are looking at part of this
16 connection from Palm Desert to La Quinta at involving some

17 Indian Wells territory, if you will. I'm not sure it
18 actually involves the city limits, but it would be in that
19 vicinity.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Alan.

21 MR. MUTH: Katie, are you coming back to
22 the La Quinta Palm Desert Trail?

23 MS. BARROWS: I'm going to stay on this slide
24 and do that now.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anyone else? Frank.

59

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. BOGERT: You have a beautiful plan. I'm
2 crazy about it, but where are you going to get the money?
3 And where are the finances coming from? Are some of the
4 cities going to build trails? Are you going to get money to
5 build the other trails? Or is this all a pipe dream?

6 MS. BARROWS: Well, this definitely is a
7 multi-jurisdictional effort and we would be looking at a
8 partnership. There are funds already that are being provided
9 by BLM and their staff and a significant amount of the
10 planning for this effort. Conservancy, CVAG, and all of the
11 participants in the Multiple Species Plan. Several of the
12 cities have undertaken for quite some time and are continuing
13 to work on trail development. The City of Palm Desert is
14 funding a fair portion of the trails that we are talking
15 about in their city. Rancho Mirage has done that in the
16 past. Palm Springs has done that, as well.

17 We haven't really gotten to the point of
18 determining where all that funding will occur, but we would
19 be looking at essentially a partnership much like we have
20 done in many other cases asking the cities to partner with
21 the federal and state agencies to make that happen.

22 I appreciate that it's a very significant
23 funding need, and we do need to put that together. But I
24 think one of the fortunate things in the trail world, there
25 are also a lot of grant monies and funds available for trail
60

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 development I think we can tap into once we get the actual
2 plan down. We will be looking at doing that in the coming
3 spring and fall.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Go ahead.

5 MS. BARROWS: I did want to talk about the
6 proposed trail between Palm Desert over here and La Quinta.
7 And at this time, we have three different alternatives being
8 looked at for that trail. And those are what you see here in
9 yellow. I'm going to go through those briefly. Essentially
10 the goal is to provide a trail that would start at the
11 Visitors' Center in Palm Desert right here, use this proposed
12 perimeter trail shown in purple that gets you up to the ridge
13 line, and then the trail would need to drop down into Deep
14 Canyon here and then go up another ridgeline in this area,
15 and then come back down over here into La Quinta. As you can
16 see, there are several different proposals.

17 One aspect of that is the route from the
18 Visitors' Center on this perimeter trail and down into Deep
19 Canyon would be the same in all three alternatives. And it
20 does involve the cooperation of the University of California
21 and the Deep Canyon Reserve here. And Alan has been very
22 involved in working on that, if there is a way to do that and
23 not compromise the machines and the research station. It
24 does involve some Coachella valley Water District land and
25 Ironwood and -- I don't know if the reserve lands are

61

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 involved.

2 But anyway, there is a route that would come
3 down through Deep Canyon and cut across right up the northern
4 boundary of the UC Reserve. From there, there are three
5 different proposals, and we are starting from the north.
6 Alternative A, which kind of wraps around -- this is -- let
7 me just give you a little orientation here, if I can figure
8 it out myself.

9 This is the Living Desert right in here. And
10 the reserve is right in this area, the County Club Reserve,
11 not the Deep Canyon Reserve, right in this area. So we are
12 looking at one trail, the northern route that would wrap
13 around Eisenhower Mountain located here. That's owned by the
14 City of Indian Wells with a lease arrangement with the Living
15 Desert. That trail goes along the edge of the slope. This
16 is a relatively rugged trail. Actually, a number of our

17 group have been hiking these trails in the last couple of
18 weeks, so if you want some testimony about how exciting this
19 trail is, you can talk to Jim Kenna or Bill or Eddy.

20 One of the things that does is wrap around
21 Indio Mountain here and -- the ridgeline basically runs
22 around like this and drops down into the La Quinta area,
23 right in the northern limits of the Cove. Some of the
24 benefits of that in terms of the way that was described were
25 to try to create an alignment that doesn't cut through

62

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 habitat as much as it might. All of these issues with regard
2 to the various biological impacts and the values of the trail
3 in terms of the hiking experience are all part of the
4 analysis that we will be going through.

5 The second alternative is one shown by this
6 line and that would go near Indio Mountain. That starts from
7 the same location and comes up to the ridgeline and then down
8 a fairly steep canyon and comes out right here about in the
9 middle of La Quinta Cove.

10 A third alternative: The southern route
11 follows a fairly -- well, it's a pretty amazingly straight
12 line. There is a canyon almost that cuts through here, and
13 that one, I guess in terms of elevation, is perhaps the
14 lowest trail. This is an alignment initially developed in
15 consultation with the City of Palm Desert and others. And
16 basically what we are looking at at this time is developing

17 the criteria that would be used to analyze these three
18 alternatives. Those criteria would include biological
19 factors, impact to sheep, to their water sources, to their
20 lambing habitat. What are the benefits of the trail in terms
21 of the hiking experience? Is it so difficult that only Joan
22 Taylor and Jeff and a few other hardy individuals can
23 actually hike the trail? Does it have other impacts with
24 regard to cultural resources and other natural resource
25 issues? What is the cost of construction and those kinds of
63

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 elements. So we are in the process of putting those criteria
2 together.

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Terry, you have a question?

4 MS. HENDERSON: Actually, I have two
5 questions.

6 I appreciate that the shortest distance between
7 two points is a straight line. But I have never seen a trail
8 that straight. But we are seeing kind of fragmented pieces
9 here, although the way I see it, eventually it would appear
10 that you could potentially go from La Quinta into Palm
11 Desert, the Palm Desert trail over into Rancho Mirage. I
12 don't recall whether I saw any connection between Rancho
13 Mirage and Cathedral City. Is there any desire to do that?

14 MS. BARROWS: There is probably a desire.
15 It's a little bit more difficult area for several reasons.
16 This immediate area south of Magnesia Cove is all part of the

17 state ecological reserve and they have limitations to the
18 extent trail use could be allowed. And then you move into --
19 this is the Thunderbird Country Club area. And there is the
20 fence and then there is Thunderbird Country Club. So the
21 opportunities for trail activity in that area are also
22 somewhat limited because of both.

23 MS. HENDERSON: Was I right that potentially
24 you would be able to do the La Quinta to probably Rancho
25 Mirage?

64

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. BARROWS: At least over the years there
2 has been discussion at least for maybe equestrian use, we
3 might be able to tie into the Rancho Mirage trail system that
4 goes along, down on the valley floor. So we could ultimately
5 have a trail that connects from one area to the other.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other questions?

7 MR. MUTH: On the southern two alternatives,
8 there are sheep problems there. Those areas are used by
9 sheep. If you look at your blue lines which are seasonal
10 closures because of concerns about sheep. If you go north
11 you have got a small isolated island there which I presume is
12 the --

13 MS. BARROWS: That's the Eisenhower Mountain
14 Trail.

15 MR. MUTH: So that is seasonal closure. It is

16 contiguous with the ridge.

17 MS. BARROWS: These blue lines show the
18 existing trail.

19 MR. MUTH: I thought they showed seasonal
20 closure.

21 MS. BARROWS: Actually all shaded in blue are
22 areas that could be subject to seasonal closures. The blue
23 dashed lines are the trail lines themselves. And this yellow
24 dotted pattern is within the perimeter trail areas that we
25 have described. So that particular Eisenhower Trail would

65

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 not be closed.

2 MR. MUTH: Okay, I misinterpreted that. But
3 there are sheep issues in those southern two trails. And
4 Eddy, you were on the trail this last week?

5 MR. KONO: Yes.

6 MR. MUTH: Do you perceive some comment from
7 Fish and Game?

8 MR. KONO: Yes, there was sheep sign on the
9 Indio Mountain Trail alignment and there was -- there are
10 other issues. We didn't go on the La Quinta side of the
11 southernmost route, but we were on the other side. But with
12 that route, there are lambing areas in that area.

13 MR. MUTH: How about the northernmost route,
14 the torturous route?

15 MR. KONO: The northernmost route, well, on

16 the side where the Living Desert Trail is, that's a
17 year-round trail. That's going to stay there.

18 MS. GEORGE: Speak up, please, just a wee bit
19 for the court reporter.

20 MR. KONO: This trail is year-round, and there
21 are a lot of people on it. We did, when we did go up to
22 here, I believe right along this edge here, we did find some
23 sheep sign there. And there are a few sheep sightings in
24 that area. They are mostly rams. We were -- we went out,
25 and we were looking at a more -- at a different route than is

66

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 on here, a more sheep-friendly one, generally trying to keep
2 it the lower elevation in the valley.

3 What we noticed here was that the sheep sign
4 was generally high up on the ridges. We did look in some of
5 the valleys here and there wasn't any sheep sign. So we were
6 looking for a different route that might be more sheep-
7 friendly. But we found a lot of sheep sign right here within
8 a half a mile of the La Quinta Cove, on that route. So we
9 haven't specifically looked at the lower route yet.

10 MR. KENNA: Are there any water sources in
11 that area?

12 MR. KONO: In the northern area?

13 MR. KENNA: Right.

14 MR. KONO: On the map, there are three water

15 sources on the map. There is one that's right -- it's on the
16 BLM parcel just maybe 100 yards in from where the road is. I
17 went and looked at that, and it looks like it's an old water
18 tank that may have burned down or something. But there is a
19 pipeline that comes out of the canyon there that comes down
20 to that. And it's still green around there. There are some
21 Palo Verde growing around it.

22 On the map also, this trail, there is a Fish
23 and Game parcel over here. And we looked at -- there are two
24 water sources listed on the map on there. And again, I was
25 looking down the hill at it. And it's right up against the

67

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 golf course, the La Quinta Resort right there. It's maybe 10
2 feet away from the green part.

3 MR. KENNA: Are they guzzlers?

4 MR. KONO: It looks like a guzzler and
5 possible water tank site there. And there was a round wooden
6 platform, but there is nothing there. And I saw a cement
7 structure with a pipe in it. Again, I was looking through
8 binoculars so I don't think they are active water sources.
9 And if they were, the two -- right next to the golf course,
10 you wouldn't want sheep to be coming down onto the golf
11 course.

12 MR. KENNA: How about water along the
13 southerly, straight alignment?

14 MR. KONO: This one, I haven't been on this

15 portion here. I didn't see any water sources. There are a
16 few Tenajas and things in this area. But we have yet to get
17 out on this one.

18 Again, because these trails do cross Fish and
19 Game lands, and we have to look back through our records and
20 find out the purpose of why the lands were purchased and then
21 any trail designation would have to be consistent with the
22 intent of those.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Allan.

24 MR. MUTH: Just a clarifying comment, lest my
25 comments about the sheep should be misconstrued, I'm not

68

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 raising any objections to the trail across Deep Canyon on the
2 northern boundary and any of those three trails to go across
3 would still encounter the same set of concerns with Ironwood,
4 UC, the water district. So just to clarify that point.

5 MR. KONO: Down here in the Bear Creek area,
6 it's a heavily used -- it's a lambing area, for one. And as
7 far as sheep sightings, they are concentrated down in this
8 area here, with a few sporadic ones up here. And that may be
9 a result of looking more down here for sheep. They were
10 collared down here. They don't capture and collar sheep down
11 in this area.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions, comments
13 before we go to the next slide?

14 MS. BARROWS: This is just to point out to you

15 that there were several other areas where similar trails have
16 been proposed. As I mentioned, what we are working on
17 Multiple Species Plan and what I have just described is to do
18 the environmental analysis as part of the plan so that when
19 the Multiple Species Plan is approved, those trails would
20 essentially be ready to be constructed. The environmental
21 review involving cultural resources and biology and so forth
22 have already been completed.

23 There are several trails that have been
24 discussed in that perimeter trail concept that we may not be
25 able to do that with because the issues and the time line

69

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 that we are under will not allow that. But we would probably
2 continue to describe the potential for those trails.

3 So I didn't explain all of the symbols on the
4 map, but this is Palm Springs, this is the Chino Canyon area
5 going up to the tram station, and these yellow areas are the
6 perimeter trails areas that have been delineated in which
7 perimeter trails could be created. We moved a step farther
8 to the extent we can to try to actually describe those
9 alignments and routes. But we are looking, in addition, we
10 can't forget down here, but the connection from Cathedral
11 City to Palm Springs -- this is the North Likken Trail right
12 here. And we were looking at the possibility for a trail that
13 would take off from that point and if possible go across the
14 Chino Canyon fan and continue somehow along -- it's difficult

15 to say along the toe of the slope or in the mountains because
16 that's an extremely rugged area. But in some way to connect
17 a trail from the Chino fan area over to Snow Creek and where
18 the Pacific Crest Trail actually comes under the freeway and
19 ultimately up into the San Jacintos here.

20 So this yellow area describes the perimeter
21 trail area in which that could occur. We will continue to
22 work on that. We are working with the BLM and various
23 wildlife agencies to try to facilitate that process, but we
24 don't have an exact alignment there yet.

25 And likewise, in the La Quinta and south of La
70

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Quinta area, these are the perimeter trails we discussed and
2 the Morrow Trail coming over to Lake Cahuilla here. The
3 Coachella Valley Park and Recreation District has property
4 now that involves an area right south of Lake Cahuilla, and
5 they are developing a natural area and trail system pretty
6 much south -- just barely southeast of Lake Cahuilla. As
7 part of that, their ownership actually involves some -- it's
8 not ownership, but it's land that is controlled by the Bureau
9 of Reclamation, I guess ultimately the BLM, that they have a
10 long-term lease on. And they would be looking at a possible
11 trail that would basically follow along the levy system that
12 continues down along here for a trail that might primarily be
13 used by equestrian users, but also, at some kind of trail
14 that would allow folks to continue down along the southern

15 slopes of the Santa Rosas.

16 We want to try to avoid that trail moving back
17 into the canyons as much as possible because that's a sheep
18 area. But ultimately that might allow something that would
19 connect to Martinez Canyon here. That's the wilderness area.

20 And the trail that actually goes up through Martinez Canyon.
21 Those are two areas from Palm Springs out to the west end at
22 Snow Creek. And down at the south end we don't have an exact
23 trail alignment. We are working on that.

24 Any questions about that particular area?

25 Okay.

71

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Buford.

2 MR. CRITES: Is the Martinez Canyon area
3 devoid of sheep?

4 MS. BARROWS: No, not at all.

5 MR. CRITES: Then why is it opened?

6 MS. BARROWS: Is there a sheep biologist in
7 the room that might help?

8 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: When we delineated the
9 seasonal trails areas, which is the stuff that's kind of
10 shaded purple or blue there, this map doesn't show it very
11 well, but Martinez Canyon basically was excluded from those.
12 The reason for that is because although we know sheep
13 occurred down there right now, the access to Martinez Canyon

14 is such that it receives very little use, either hikers,
15 equestrians or people in vehicles. So we took that into
16 consideration. And we also took into consideration a desire
17 by local equestrians that would put them up into the Cactus
18 Spring Trail and give them a ride that would last for more
19 than one day, so we took that into consideration.

20 Basically in terms of sheep signs, basically
21 what we see down there are groups of rams. We have had our
22 formerly known as sheep ambassadors, now known as recreation
23 technicians, down there for the last two years basically
24 collecting the same type of use data. And we have seen that
25 Martinez canyon receives very little use from people.

72

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Does that answer your
2 question, Buford?

3 MR. CRITES: In part. I guess the follow-up
4 is, as we lock up everything else and Martinez gets more use,
5 you are not going to then turn around and say now that it
6 gets more use, we have to lock it up.

7 MS. HUDDLESTON-LORTON: I think that probably
8 the real key to this plan is the adaptive management and
9 monitoring component where the decisions that we make in the
10 Trails Management Plan are that CVAG or whoever these
11 decision makers are will continue to monitor human use and
12 sheep distribution. And the prescription in the Trails
13 Management Plan may be subject to change. Either there will

14 be fewer trails that are closed or we could see areas where
15 we need to increase protection for sheep. So ultimately, we
16 see a very flexible system where we can respond to
17 conservation needs of Bighorn sheep and also to recreation
18 needs of the public in the Coachella Valley.

19 MR. MUTH: That was a yes.

20 MR. CRITES: I think that was a yes.

21 MS. HENDERSON: I know it was a yes.

22 MS. BARROWS: I think the important point
23 there is we really don't have a great deal of data on the --
24 we really don't have a lot of data on the use of trails. The
25 sheep ambassador program that Bureau of Land Management has

73

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 been involved in over the last couple of years is the first
2 time we have actually been able in determining how much trail
3 use there is on many of these trails. And we are right now
4 in the process of working with the sheep biologist in trying
5 to delineate a monitoring program that would focus on that
6 program.

7 MR. CRITES: It would seem, then, we could
8 open a lot of other trails in sheep habitat as long as we
9 didn't use them.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Another in-depth
11 observation.

12 MS. BARROWS: Well, that's the last slide,
13 actually. I just wanted to summarize.

14 There are other elements of the trail plan that
15 are described on page 2. We are looking at a free self-
16 permitting kind of system where we have a permit that folks
17 would fill out at the trailhead. And the focus of that
18 effort is to try to collect additional data on trail use. So
19 that's one element of the proposed plan.

20 We have already touched on the monitoring, but
21 I think this is a very significant part of this whole system
22 and the idea of it is adaptive and it can change. And we
23 really do need to start with a base line of information.
24 That we are just really at the beginning of having to really
25 look at how much trail use there is and what the impacts of

74

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 that use might be on the sheep.

2 It would be a process where we would have a
3 trails committee that would be established as part of the
4 whole management effort for the Multiple Species Plan that
5 would involve obviously the state and federal and local
6 agencies that are landowners, biologists and so forth. So
7 that would be another aspect of this, a committee that would
8 work on some of the management issues that you touched on as
9 well as the monitoring.

10 And certainly, a public information program
11 that's already underway as part of the Monuments effort, but
12 we want to extend that effort so that people really have an
13 understanding of the resources that are out there and the

14 biological and recreational issues that we are dealing with.
15 Okay.

16 Just briefly, in terms of the schedule for all
17 of this, this effort with regard to the perimeter trails is
18 sort of our focus at this time. We are very close to
19 beginning the environmental review for that. The general
20 effort with regard to the Multiple Species Plan kind of
21 dictates the schedule for the trails plan. And we are now
22 looking at a draft public review, which is the next step for
23 the Multiple Species Plan that would go out to the public and
24 would provide a public comment period. So that's really the
25 process by which folks could have input into the trails plan,

75

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 although I think we have made a significant effort all the
2 way along to involve all the interested parties. The draft
3 public review for the Multiple Species Plan is scheduled for
4 the summer. I was going to say -- I was going to decide
5 whether I should tell you a year or not.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Probably 2005.

7 MS. BARROWS: Something like that sounds safe
8 to me. We are not talking about the summer of this year for
9 the public review draft, and that would include the Santa
10 Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains trails plan. That would have
11 a comment period, and we would have public hearings during
12 which public comment would be received. BLM has already
13 taken public comment as part of their CDCA amendment process

14 but the final decision in terms of this whole trail plan will
15 be in that Multiple Species Planning process.

16 BLM would on their land obviously issue a
17 record of decision for the BLM land, and we are working very
18 closely with the cities and state and other jurisdictions
19 because everyone as they sign onto the Multiple Species Plan
20 would sign onto the Trails Plan. So we are having regular
21 interfaces with all of the cities making sure they are
22 comfortable with these trail alignments and so forth. So
23 that's basically where things stand today. I would be happy
24 to answer any other questions.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Question, Mike?

76

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. KELLNER: How about the other side of the
2 valley?

3 MS. BARROWS: The valley floor? I didn't know
4 if the Monument folks --

5 MR. KELLNER: As trails close on this side, it
6 seems like --

7 MS. BARROWS: That's certainly a very
8 important element.

9 When we started, I guess we might have been
10 very enthusiastic and thought let's do a trail plan for the
11 whole Coachella Valley as part of the Multiple Species Plan.
12 In the focus of the trails planning for the mountains, the
13 Santa Rosas and San Jacintos involve Bighorn sheep, we really

14 focused our efforts on developing a final trails plan for the
15 mountains. But we are also looking for the potential for the
16 trails and the opportunities for new trails that would help
17 to alleviate pressure on some of the trails and help provide
18 other opportunities where trails are being closed in the
19 Santa Rosas and San Jacintos.

20 So what we have done is we've been trying to
21 get feedback over the time period we have been doing this
22 plan for the valley floor area and the Indio Hills, which is
23 right in here. This would be the Sky Valley area between
24 there and Joshua Tree National Park. But these intervening
25 mountains are all part of the Joshua Tree National Park area.

77

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 We have had several public meetings as part of
2 the CVAG process to get input on that. We have developed a
3 map from the Trails Council, and I don't happen to have that
4 map with me here today, but it shows sort of a wish list of
5 trails on the valley floor. What we are doing is looking in
6 a preliminary way at whether those trails would be a concern
7 with regards to some of the biological issues.

8 We would have as part of the Multiple Species
9 plan some general guidelines for trail development on the
10 valley floor. But there are certainly some great
11 opportunities for trails. It's a little hard to see with the
12 shading, but this would be the Indio Hills area. And as part

13 of the effort to acquire land for the sand source for the
14 existing Coachella Valley Preserve system, the Mountains
15 Conservancy, the Friends of the Desert Mountains, the Center
16 for Natural Lands Management, the BLM already has an existing
17 ownership in the Indio Hills, and we have acquired a fair bit
18 of land in the Indio Hills and there are some really nice
19 trail opportunities there.

20 So we are certainly looking at the potential
21 for trails there. There are some possibilities for trails
22 certainly in the west end of the valley around Snow Creek
23 that may not have biological impact, so we are looking at
24 that. It will be more of general guidelines about trail use
25 as opposed to a specific trails plan that we are trying to at
78

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 least describe those areas that would be potential trails.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Buford.

3 MR. CRITES: Last -- a week ago when I was in
4 Sacramento I was chatting with folks in State Parks. And
5 assuming as an example that the Joshua Hills project becomes
6 public land, which may or may not happen, there are wonderful
7 opportunities over there for desert camping, which we really
8 don't have on this side. There just isn't any place over
9 here to do that.

10 But there are opportunities over there for that
11 and for connections down into the Coachella Valley Preserve
12 system and up into Joshua Tree and a whole series of things

13 and existing state park lands out in the Indio Hills and so
14 on and so forth. So there are lot of neat things over there
15 if we end up with a lot of public open space out there.

16 MS. BARROWS: Just to point out the area, this
17 is the Indio Hills here. I'm sure it's very difficult to see
18 but this is Dillon Road approximately right in through here,
19 and this is called the Fan Hill area that comes out right out
20 of -- this would be Joshua National Park. This little area
21 here called Fan Hills is approximately the area of the Joshua
22 Hills property. So there is a great deal of open space. And
23 Joshua Tree as part of their management planning process has
24 already identified access points into Joshua Tree along that
25 southern boundary that would include some of those areas.

79

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. KELLNER: It seems like a great place for
2 an equestrian park and camping and everything.

3 MS. BARROWS: Any other questions?

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other questions, comments?
5 Katie, one of our primary interests, returning to the
6 Monument, has been proper signage. Would it be anticipated
7 that the trails committee would be recommending placement of
8 signage, location of signage, degree of signage?

9 MS. BARROWS: I guess it's fair to say the
10 focus of our efforts at the present time has really been
11 looking at the planning in terms of potential trails. But I
12 think as part of the management plan that would accompany

13 this Trails Plan, we need to address that issue. It's
14 certainly a significant need. Many of our trails are not
15 well signed, if they are signed at all. And maybe it's
16 something that the Monument Advisory Committee could assist
17 with regard to that issue. I think certainly we need to
18 address it in the management plan, which would be part of
19 this whole planning effort. I don't know if we would get to
20 the point of specific recommendations on exactly where
21 signage may go.

22 MS. GEORGE: I think it would fit both with
23 trails management plan and depending on what comes up with
24 that interpretive plan with respect to type of sign, brand,
25 but then the location would be within the trails management

80

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 plan. The type so we could get a consistent sort of message
2 and work with our partners on that. That would be the best.

3 MS. BARROWS: I think one of the opportunities
4 we are seeing with all the partners involved in this
5 committee is for trail access points and trailheads that in
6 many cases occur on city lands or adjacent to city lands and
7 provides perhaps some opportunities for both residents and
8 visitors to our communities, like Danella is talking about,
9 access points into the Monument and the signage that goes
10 along with it. So we need to move that along.

11 MR. MORGAN: Signage of trail heads is
12 different than signage within the trail system. But based on

13 my experience, a good recommendation for signage would be to
14 look at the Agua Calientes. It's unobtrusive and
15 informative, and you can't get lost. So use that as a base.
16 I think that would be a good starting point.

17 MR. KELLNER: We did that with just
18 coordinating between US Forest Service, Bureau of Land
19 Management, what was existing, what their standards were, and
20 took a stab at something that we could all use, knowing that
21 there was going to be a lot more trail work, not a lot more
22 trails to be signed just for our area behind the Indian
23 Canyons area where we did have BLM land and US Forest
24 Service. So we tried to standardize between the three
25 groups, and it seems to be working, pretty well.

81

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments? Are we
2 finished? Thank you very much. Great presentation. Let's
3 take a break until 15 minutes after the hour.

4 (Brief recess was taken.)

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Back on the record. We
6 begin with Bill Havert. He has a couple of comments for us.

7 MR. HAVERT: I was just going to make a very
8 brief report as far as acquisitions in the National Monument
9 area. And the main ones that have occurred in recent months
10 are several acquisitions that the Agua Caliente band did that
11 probably totaled over 300 acres in Palm Canyon and also west
12 of Palm Canyon. There was an acquisition also recently that

13 was a partnership among the City of Palm Desert, the BLM, and
14 the Conservancy of the property you see out the window here
15 called Fox Canyon.

16 MS. HENDERSON: If we put this map back up,
17 could you use the light?

18 MR. HAVERT: Actually, I can even use this map
19 for that matter. But some of the acquisitions that I
20 mentioned so far along Palm Canyon, several of the sections
21 in this area, actually sort of straddling Palm Canyon were
22 completed by the Agua Caliente. And another section, plus,
23 which is one of these up here on the side of the mountain
24 west of Palm Canyon as well.

25 And the one I just mentioned, the partnership
82

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 among the City of Palm Desert and the BLM and the Conservancy
2 is this area in here off of Highway 74, sort of behind the
3 Desert Crossings Shopping Center. The Conservancy did a
4 grant to the Friends of the Desert Mountains and picked up
5 400-some-odd acres over in this area. That's between Chino
6 Canyon and Blasedale Canyon over in that area. On some of
7 the maps it shows up as Desert Angel, a name associated with
8 that area.

9 And then we also did a grant to the American
10 Land Conservancy to pick up a little over 500 acres -- I
11 think that's this one right here which is sort of at the head

12 of Palm Canyon on something called Omstott Creek. So those
13 are the most recent ones I'm aware of. There were also some
14 additional inholdings down in the Santa Rosa Mountains
15 wilderness that have closed recently. And there may be some
16 other acquisition that could have come to fruition from BLM
17 as well. But progress.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you, Bill. Any
19 questions on that?

20 I would remind you that side conversations,
21 especially that close to the reporter, make it very difficult
22 for her to define the words. Okay.

23 Let's go to the big question: Where does the
24 advisory committee want to go in 2003 and beyond? Danella.

25 MS. GEORGE: Thank you, Mr. Chair. If you

83

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 guys pull out your packet, there is a handout that follows
2 this Power Point. You also all have another copy of the
3 charter enclosed. And in your packets somewhere, you have
4 how to write a mission statement. And what I thought I would
5 do is first go over the Power Point, pretty short, but we
6 will review the chart and we will review some actions in here
7 that you need to talk about. Then I thought the group could
8 talk about -- the committee could talk about where they want
9 to go in the future, so that if they want to continue on
10 after the plan, we initiate the process to start
11 rechartering. Sound good?

12 So with that, just thought we would review the
13 legislation. And basically the Secretary of the Interior and
14 the Secretary of Agriculture shall jointly establish an
15 advisory committee for the National Monument, whose purposes
16 shall be to advise the Secretaries with respect to the
17 operation and implementation of the management plan -- which
18 is what you guys have all been doing.

19 The termination in that legislation says the
20 advisory committee shall cease to exist on the date upon
21 which the management plan is officially adopted by the
22 Secretaries or later at the discretion of the Secretaries.

23 But the later discretion business means we need
24 to initiate something to submit to the Secretaries' office,
25 what you see your mission to be after the Monument plan has

84

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 been signed. The time line you all received shows still
2 having a date of October 24, Friday, 2003, to try to have
3 that plan signed by Regional Forester and State Director.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella, the way you read it
5 was rechartering. The way I read this, it would be an
6 extension of the existing charter.

7 MS. GEORGE: Okay.

8 MS. HENDERSON: Terry Henderson, La Quinta.
9 With the discussions that we have had here on the amount of
10 time that it takes for reappointment, what is the realistic
11 date that this actually, even if we are finished, will be

12 signed by October 24th?

13 MS. GEORGE: Oh, I think if we start this one,
14 Terry, really we could probably get it done within maybe 90
15 days. Just kind of a gut intuitive feeling. People are
16 aware of it in the different organizations, and I think we
17 could probably do it in about 90 days for an extension and
18 have a letter back.

19 MS. HENDERSON: So we can looking at
20 submission in July?

21 MS. GEORGE: After this meeting -- well, yeah,
22 after this meeting and after this discussion when we close
23 today, I hope in this discussion we will have a motion and a
24 decision will be made. And if that decision is to go
25 forward, then we will start the process in about a week or

85

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 two because of workload. Any other questions? Okay.

2 So the charter as it exists today says your
3 role is to advise the Secretary of the Interior and the
4 Secretary of Agriculture with respect to the preparation and
5 implementation of the management plan for the conservation
6 and protection of the Santa Rosa and San Jacinto Mountains
7 National Monument as required by the Santa Rosa and San
8 Jacinto National Monument Act in 2000 and other applicable
9 provisions of the law, including those cited in Section 15 of
10 this charter.

11 So things that we have done so far, we have
12 agreed to do a Federal Register notice to have meetings out
13 until December. In talking with Connell, we thought perhaps
14 since we are meeting already February 1, to do that out to
15 February of 2004. So that's something we decide at least to
16 have it for the next two months after, theoretically, the
17 plan will be signed. We know you all want to meet. So
18 that's one thing.

19 And things you could help us with in the
20 future. Things we were thinking was how the members can
21 assist in the implementation of the plan. Coordination with
22 local jurisdictions and planning efforts going on there.
23 Leveraging dollars, getting grants, things we talked about
24 today with the trail system, what that's going to cost and
25 how we can do it in partnership with all the local entities

86

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 and the tribes.

2 Remain active advocates for the Monument. And
3 we recently talked about work groups for like the wilderness,
4 coming back and making a wilderness proposal. This morning
5 there was a discussion about a work group for signage. These
6 are the sorts of things the committee could do after the plan
7 was signed. And I will now leave it to the committee for you
8 all to discuss as to what you can do for the future.

9 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: The primary thing missing
10 from that list is the thing we have talked about: This group

11 would act as a sounding board and public input.

12 MS. GEORGE: Okay.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Which I think would be the
14 most important use of this group. Other comment?

15 MS. HENDERSON: Comment.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes, Terry.

17 MS. HENDERSON: Not to hopefully be a negative
18 amongst a group of very positive and progressive folks and a
19 progressive plan that we have been working on, but sometimes
20 I think we may have all wondered in our lifetime why certain
21 government agencies or committees don't go away and why there
22 is a belief in the system that should be ongoing. And what I
23 have seen is that there are currently a significant number of
24 agencies dealing with all these issues. And yes, we have
25 brought it together and we are trying to incorporate all that

87

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 thinking into a plan. But I kind of like to have an
2 impression from the public, have they felt that coming to
3 these meetings has given them some sense of participating or
4 just another meeting to go to to have voiced the same
5 opinions over and over again. Is there really a reason for
6 this group to continue at the end of the process, after
7 October 24, 2003?

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Good point. Anybody want to
9 talk about that a little bit? Yes. Please identify
10 yourself.

11 MR. McARTHUR: Karl McArthur from the UC
12 Cooperative Extension. We are talking about an adaptive
13 process, and I think these processes have to be adaptive over
14 time, and I think you are going to need public input. I
15 mean, that's how science and politics both work and travel
16 through time and it adapts as it goes.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you. Any other
18 comments? Jeff.

19 MR. MORGAN: Yeah. Generally, when you come
20 up with plan of any kind for public land, it is going to need
21 changing. You cannot just make one plan, and it's there
22 forever. It's got to be redone every few years, every five
23 years, in some cases, every 20 years, depending if it's the
24 BLM or not. But it's something that is an ongoing thing so
25 it is going to need some forum for public input.

88

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. ROCHE: Mary Roche. I think the thing
2 that is missing here is that the plan is done. The mission
3 is for us to advise the Secretary of Interior, Secretary of
4 Agriculture. Once they have the plan in place, I think it's
5 very important for us to have a local perspective and
6 oversight to them. Otherwise, it's so far removed. And the
7 more I get involved, the more I see how far removed things
8 are. And you simply don't know what's going on. And
9 secondly, I think on the converse, it's very important for

10 the local jurisdictions to have a forum for voicing how they
11 think it's being implemented and carried out.

12 MS. HENDERSON: If I could -- and then there
13 is a gentleman behind you. But -- and I appreciate all these
14 comments and that was why I asked the question was to
15 generate some dialogue.

16 The adoption of the Multispecies Habitat Plan
17 which will also have the trail system in it will be an
18 ongoing living document right here in the Coachella Valley
19 that we will continue to work with and adapt and have to meet
20 the ever-changing demands. And I still would wonder about
21 the broader aspect of the Monument plan and the existence.

22 But as I said, there is a gentleman behind you
23 that had his hands up.

24 MR. WOODS: As sadly -- John Woods, Alpine
25 Village, one of the few members of the public that is

89

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 attending these meetings.

2 I got the impression -- and I would like to get
3 clarification from you -- your statement about whether or not
4 or your question about whether or not the public should be
5 involved or not, I felt like your issue was whether there
6 should be a goal and a termination point for this committee.
7 The public, I think, would always be involved in public
8 issues and have public input. I didn't think that was the
9 issue.

10 But I do know that a lot of people that I'm
11 familiar with don't attend the meetings because basically
12 they get disenchanted with the process, the timing of the
13 process, a lot of feeling that their input is not really
14 taken seriously or even recorded for anybody to do anything
15 with. I think that when Ed said before that one of the prime
16 goals or issues with the implementation of the plan is the
17 public input process, I think that's what this is all about.

18 I think that people that are affected directly
19 by this or indirectly by this one way or another should have
20 this forum and the opportunity to come in and say what their
21 concerns are for this committee to take into consideration.
22 And I think that's what you are doing here. Unfortunately
23 there are not that many people coming in because I don't know
24 a lot of them understand the process, know what the meetings
25 are about, or hear about the meetings on any kind of a

90

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 regular basis.

2 I still myself, I have these meetings all
3 listed in my calendar so that I will remember to attend them.
4 But I get no notifications of them. I had no word that they
5 are regularly published other than if I go online, and of
6 course, there are lot of people still not online. But I do
7 think it's extremely important to have the public input and
8 try to get support for what you want to do or find out what
9 the public is against in terms of the Monument issues.

10 MS. HENDERSON: If I could respond. In no way
11 did I ever suggest there shouldn't be public input. My
12 curiosity was, as the public, do you feel this is valuable
13 coming to these meetings and your input in fact is being
14 received, considered and acted on, whether it's up or down.
15 And I think you have addressed that and I do -- I know as the
16 public, a lot of times I go to the meeting and wonder why am
17 I here? They are not listening to me anyway. And I hope
18 that we have not given that impression, but maybe we have.

19 MR. WOODS: To me this is a little bit like
20 diamond mining. Every once in a while you find a little
21 shiny stone that sparks your interest and keeps you coming.
22 A lot of people play golf because every once in a while they
23 get a really good shot and it brings them back to the course.

24 But one of the things I have garnered from
25 these meetings is that this is an extremely cumbersome

91

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 process, like so many other government processes or
2 government-related processes. So I do have a hard time with
3 that. I'm used to dealing with situations where we deal with
4 projects that have a beginning, a middle, and an end. And
5 that's not quite the way a lot of committees and government
6 functions work, although I realize there are a lot of
7 government functions that have to go on forever.

8 I think that most committees are formed for the
9 purpose or a purpose: To resolve an issue or reach a goal.

10 And at that point, they have done their job. Let's move on,
11 and if we need a new committee or need to decide some other
12 issue -- but let's establish what the goals are, go after
13 those goals and be done with it.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes, Allan.

15 MR. MUTH: The fact that -- let's back up.
16 With regard to public participation, the first few meetings,
17 there were a lot of people here. The first few meetings were
18 interminably boring and dense and opaque. There is no way to
19 get around that. That's just the process. You have amazing
20 tenacity if you have been to every one of them and you are
21 still coming here voluntarily.

22 MR. WOODS: I don't know if that's a virtue.

23 MR. MUTH: There are probably two people in
24 the room that understand the process, Connell and Danella.
25 The rest of us follow their lead. So the fact that the

92

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 public has decreased, it would be amazing if that were not
2 the case. Once we get a plan in place and it's out in the
3 community for a while, issues will come up. When that
4 happens, then the public will start coming back to the
5 meetings. We don't have to meet every two months. If we
6 continue, twice a year might do it. But when the thing is on
7 the ground for a while, then I would expect more public
8 participation. Something we can do to convey to the agencies
9 what the community wants. So just some observations.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Yes, sir.

11 MR. McARTHUR: I would say it's nice to have
12 an established capacity -- you don't have to meet every
13 month -- but have the established capacity for when an issue
14 does come up, it will pack a room and you have a lot of
15 concern on the part of the public. We have people there to
16 kick around the ideas and represent the communities.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comment? Speaking on
18 behalf of the committee, I think that this committee has
19 probably listened more to the public than most committees
20 that I -- and city councils -- that I attend, which is quite
21 often. And I think that we took into account most of the
22 comments and desires that we could. Unfortunately, some of
23 the early comments didn't have a whole lot to do with the
24 Monument, so there wasn't much we could do about it, or at
25 least this committee and its responsibility.

93

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 So I want to take this opportunity to commend
2 this committee on the fact that they did listen and they did
3 react. And I think that the product that we forwarded to the
4 agencies reflected that and truly reflected the desires of
5 this community. Other comments? Thank you for that
6 question, Terry, it needed to be said.

7 Danella.

8 MS. GEORGE: I wanted to ask the committee if
9 it would be helpful for the Monument Manager to go to your

10 city councils with you at city council meetings and give a
11 briefing on the Monument and update where we are or to the
12 Tram Board Authority or State Parks, if that would help, as
13 well, with how you represent constituents that have been
14 identified in the legislation. And you are their
15 representative here of sharing the information with them.
16 Bary has set me up for Cathedral City and on February 26th,
17 we are going to the City Council. So if I can do that, I'm
18 out there to do that for you.

19 MR. FREET: Maybe you can change the term. I
20 didn't set you up.

21 MS. GEORGE: I just wanted to throw that out
22 too. Okay.

23 What I would like to do is just kind of
24 continue with this Power Point, which Buford is going to give
25 me a rating on at lunch, I think. And missions -- I'm hung

94

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 up on these mission statement things. I guess I have worked
2 with mission statements for a while, and I always liked them
3 because a group can go back to them when they get hung up on
4 stuff and take a look at them and see what their role is and
5 what they are supposed to do. I believe in keeping them
6 simple.

7 So I did a handout for you guys and found a
8 three pager that I thought was helpful and some other
9 research and just stole this from Carter McNamara. At its

10 most basic, the mission statement describes the overall
11 purpose of the organization. And there are three key
12 questions that that mission statement should answer: What
13 are the opportunities or needs that we exist to address, the
14 purpose? What are we doing to address those needs, the
15 business of the organization? And what principles or beliefs
16 guide our work, values of the organization? And I repeated
17 Carter's statement there: At its most basic, the mission
18 statement describes the overall purpose of the organization.

19 Tips: Jargon-free; use proactive, action
20 verbs, short enough so that folks can remember it. And I
21 wonder what age group of folks that means. And to motivate
22 folks.

23 So I gave you all some examples because you
24 should know the examples of what mission statements exist for
25 the agencies here at the table. And the National Landscape

95

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Conservation System, NLCS, which is the monuments system for
2 BLM, their mission statement is "BLM's great American
3 landscape, healthy, wild, and open."

4 Forest Service, "Caring for the land and
5 serving people."

6 BLM, "Sustains the health, diversity and
7 productivity of the public lands for use of present and
8 future generations."

9 MR. CRITES: Before you move, if you take the

10 second one, stick the word Monument in there.

11 MS. GEORGE: "Caring for the Monument and
12 serving people."

13 MR. CRITES: And go on our way.

14 MS. GEORGE: Okay. This is good. And one
15 that we set up for the -- or developed for the Interagency
16 Work Group, we came up with "A shared vision for resource
17 management and public service." And that's the Interagency
18 Work Group for the Monument.

19 What I did is, I took a stab at it, just wanted
20 to kind of throw some things out there. So the purpose -- I
21 stole it from the charter and the legislation. "To advise
22 the assistant secretaries and the legislatively identified
23 partners with the management plan and the implementation of
24 the plan."

25 The business that you all do is advocacy, you 96

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 identify issues, take input from the public, make
2 recommendations.

3 The values I see that you guys all share is you
4 seem to be dedicated community leaders, you are all
5 articulate, you're visionary and practical.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Most of us, anyhow.

7 MS. GEORGE: That's open for discussion too,
8 what we just discussed. And I'm comfortable taking what
9 Buford said, or do you guys want to carry it any further

10 or --

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comments?

12 MR. LYMAN: From a government entity,
13 everybody has their mission statements and most people could
14 care less about them. And L.A.P.D. probably has the most
15 recognizable, "To serve and protect." Keep it very short and
16 sweet. If you go into most government agencies, it's a

17 dialogue, and who cares. And I think it gets us where we
18 need to be.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments? Jeff.

20 MR. MORGAN: I would like to go back to the
21 charter. It states quite clearly, conservation and
22 protection or preservation is where we should be, of the
23 National Monument.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments? My own
25 feeling I think I have expressed, and I will express again:

97

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 That I think our prime job, if you will, is to provide a
2 conduit. And in response to your comments, Jeff, I think
3 that it's nice but that isn't something we do. I think the

4 same thing with Buford's, it's nice, but I don't think that's
5 what we would do. I think if we are going to have this and I
6 agree with Bob that I think that these things are somewhat
7 superfluous, that we ought to express so that the public does
8 understand what we are here for, and I'm open to argument. I

9 think we should be a conduit, plain and simple. Terry.

10 MS. HENDERSON: We are waiting for your
11 suggestion.

12 MR. CRITES: In six words or less.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: In six words or less, yes.
14 I don't know. Provide a conduit operation on the operation
15 and well-being --

16 MR. CRITES: Ed, you are going to be a public
17 servant if you talk like that.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY -- of the Monument. You
19 asked.

20 MR. CRITES: My error.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Agreed. So that is my
22 somewhat unprepared suggestion. John.

23 MR. WOODS: I have a question and I don't want
24 this to sound as negative as I'm sure it is going to. We are
25 into 13 months, and are you just developing a mission

98

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 statement?

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: No, we were given our
3 original mission statement. Now we are trying to provide a
4 very few words that would express our reason for continuing.

5 MS. HENDERSON: Just going to what we have
6 already had out here, caring for the Monument, serving
7 people. And then listening to you, maybe there is a way of
8 shifting that priority, serving the people, caring for the

9 Monument, putting people first, if you will, maybe looking
10 for a word other than "serving," but "serving" works for me,
11 and then the Monument secondary.

12 MR. CRITES: So seconded.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Other comments?

14 Danella, are you looking for specific wording
15 to be approved by this body today, or are you looking for
16 ideas that might provide you and your staff with the
17 wherewithal to come back to us at our next meeting with a
18 specific recommendation?

19 MS. GEORGE: I can do both. Ideally, I would
20 like for you all to make up the mission statement because you
21 are the team. So we have another 15 minutes. It's a short
22 presentation, this one was, to lunch. If we could maybe come
23 up with something, I would prefer that. Otherwise, I can
24 bring something back.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Bill.

99

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. HAVERT: Put that slide on that Buford and
2 Terry were responding to. I think they were pretty close to
3 developing something.

4 MS. HENDERSON: Just to see if it lives or
5 dies, I will make a motion that it's "Serving people and
6 caring for the Monument."

7 MR. CRITES: National Monument.

8 MS. HENDERSON: National Monument.

9 MR. CRITES: Second.

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comment. Alan?

11 MR. MUTH: For some reason, "serving the
12 people" doesn't ring right with me. How about "representing
13 the people." I guess it's "serving." Maybe it's a subtlety
14 I'm not grasping, but somehow "serving the people" doesn't
15 sound as good to me as "representing the people."

16 MS. HENDERSON: I agree.

17 MR. CRITES: Okay.

18 MS. HENDERSON: I am willing to modify it.
19 "Representing the people and caring for the National
20 Monument."

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Second agreeable?

22 MR. CRITES: Yes.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Do we have further comment
24 on the motion? Any further comment on the motion? Danella,
25 you wrote that down?

100

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. GEORGE: "Representing the people and
2 caring for the National Monument.

3 MR. MORGAN: It's more than six words.

4 MS. GEORGE: That's okay. Six to nine words
5 is fine.

6 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Does everyone understand the
7 adjusted motion?

8 MS. GEORGE: "Representing the people and

9 caring for the National Monument."

10 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: All those who favor it? Any
11 opposed. For this one, I think we will ask the in limbo
12 representatives to express their votes, please.

13 MR. HAVERT: Aye, in limbo.

14 MR. LYMAN: Aye.

15 MR. PARKINS: Yes.

16 MR. FREET: Yes.

17 MS. GEORGE: We covered the next item. I did
18 a process on how to do the reappointment and the nominations,
19 so we don't want to go there again.

20 But we do want to go to ticklers. And somebody
21 asked me if I would ask the committee today to identify a
22 member in the committee to track motions and restate them for
23 the committee prior to voting. It's currently working, but
24 we have to dig a lot sometimes when we are reviewing the
25 notes as they come in, the draft court reporter notes. So I

101

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 wanted to ask you, Mr. Chair, if you could bring that to the
2 committee and talk about that of identifying one member to
3 track motions, restate those motions very clearly.

4 MR. CRITES: That's the chair's business.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That is the chair's
6 responsibility. Which I do, and if there is a concern, then
7 we can always ask the court reporter to repeat back the exact
8 wording. But so far we have been able to depend upon you,

9 Danella, who makes nice notes at certain times and bring it
10 forward. And that's why I always before the voting ask if
11 everyone understands the motion. So I think that that's
12 being done.

13 MS. GEORGE: Thank you. Okay. So that's it.
14 I'm done.

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, I think your notes on
16 how to track items currently is working. I think it works as
17 long as we read carefully the official minutes, which I try
18 to do, and remind the staff of things that sometimes slip
19 through the cracks. And I would certainly ask each of you
20 to, if you think something has been brought up at a previous
21 meeting that is not being addressed, that you certainly bring
22 that up and ask about the situation or whatever the case may
23 be.

24 MS. GEORGE: Mr. Chair, I will also take
25 responsibility during the summarization of the meeting at the
102

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 end of the meeting to make sure I have covered those motions
2 with you if there are any action items that have been sent to
3 staff.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Appreciate that.

5 MR. LYMAN: I have a question. Did we agree
6 to recharter?

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I believe the question was
8 raised at our last meeting. And we agreed that we probably

9 wanted to continue. Did we take an official vote? No.

10 MR. LYMAN: Because we have -- this thing
11 technically ends October 24. Meetings are scheduled into
12 February. There seems to be possibly some conflict there.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's right. I think how
14 it was raised at our last meeting in that regard, and Danella
15 said that she would like to at the beginning of her
16 presentation have a decision by this group, which, of course,
17 raised Terry's questions as to whether we believe we want
18 to -- not recharter but extend the charter. And the chair
19 would entertain a motion to that effect.

20 MR. CRITES: So moved.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Could you express the
22 motion, please.

23 MR. CRITES: Move to request an extension of
24 the charter.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Time specific?

103

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. GEORGE: Indefinitely until you decide you
2 no longer need to exist.

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Is that the motion, then?

4 MR. CRITES: Yes.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Request extension of the
6 charter.

7 MS. HENDERSON: I second for discussion.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comment by Jeff.

9 MR. MORGAN: "Continuation of the committee
10 will be subject to periodic review and rechartering every two
11 years," so it does use the word "recharter" in the original
12 charter. So you might want to incorporate that into your
13 motion.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Then it would change your
15 motion to reflect that language, then, that it is a
16 recharter?

17 MR. CRITES: It is.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And the second agrees.

19 MS. HENDERSON: Yes.

20 MR. WOODS: I have a question.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Not on the motion. Other
22 comments?

23 MS. HENDERSON: And to clarify that, is the
24 motion -- do we need to be date-specific, two years, because
25 apparently we have to do it every two years.

104

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. CRITES: Whatever.

2 MR. MORGAN: It says after two years -- every
3 two years, it says.

4 MS. GEORGE: Required by FACA. It's one of
5 those FACA things.

6 MR. CRITES: So the motion, then, would
7 request that we request a rechartering, and that we also

8 start the process of rechartering our rechartering. We might
9 as well get that one done too.

10 So it's two of them.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I certainly appreciate
12 your --

13 MR. CRITES: Optimism.

14 MS. HENDERSON: Pessimism.

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Whatever. If I may, at the
16 option of the chair, ask for a restatement of the motion to
17 incorporate that information brought forward.

18 MR. CRITES: Move to we ask for a rechartering
19 for the next two-year time span.

20 MS. HENDERSON: Second.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Second agrees. Further
22 discussion on the motion? There being none, all in favor?
23 Any opposed? Those interim or whatever appointments please
24 express your vote, your name and your vote.

25 MR. HAVERT: Bill Havert, aye.

105

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MR. LYMAN: Bob Lyman, aye.

2 MR. FREET: Aye.

3 MR. PARKINS: Rob Parkins, aye.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very much.
5 Anything else, Danella?

6 MS. GEORGE: That's it. Thank you.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We have about seven minutes

8 and no food. The food is here?

9 MR. MUTH: There are drinks in the
10 refrigerator also.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Then we stand adjourned
12 until 1 o'clock.

13 (Lunch recess taken.)

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Ladies and gentlemen, let's
15 come back to order, please, the time being 1:00, time for
16 public input.

17 We have one request to speak, Dustin Van
18 Newlin.

19 MR. VAN NEWLIN: Hi. My name is Dustin. I
20 wish I could have been here earlier to hear what you guys
21 were discussing. I just found out about this meeting about
22 an hour ago.

23 Being a dog owner, I do understand everyone's
24 concerns. I do understand the issues also. I have a degree
25 in natural resources. Basically what I wanted to come here

106

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 to say today was that a lot of the issues and a lot of the
2 comments that I have read about seem to be coming from dog
3 owners and haven't been coming from a conservation point of
4 view.

5 One of the things that kind of disturbed me was
6 that the mayor made a comment about needing to come to a
7 compromise. But I think that there almost can't be

8 compromise. We were talking about something like desert
9 mountain sheep. The issue is they are going away. Their
10 habitat is decreasing, shrinking, becoming smaller. And one
11 of the reasons for that habitat becoming smaller is human
12 encroachment and development. And along with that, the
13 animals just can't live. Of course, we all know that habitat
14 loss, one of the most important reasons is humans encroaching
15 on their land.

16 And when we talk about causes of extinction
17 from animals -- you guys have probably all heard this before
18 and if you have, we will go over it again -- sorry about
19 this, but it's the habitat loss, exotics, pollution and
20 harvest is the main reasons for extinction of species. And
21 we want to know who gets lost first, and it is the large-
22 bodied species, which would be mountain sheep. They are
23 species with low densities of numbers which again are
24 mountain sheep, and large undulants, obviously sheep.

25 The Forest Service and the BLM both have

107

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 mandates for multiple use -- I'm sure you guys are all very
2 well aware of that -- but they also have a mandate for some
3 sort of conservation. So I'm kind of concerned that the
4 conservation is kind of being pushed along the wayside in
5 order to allow the people to use the land, which we should be
6 allowed to use, but we need to take a look at the broad
7 spectrum rather than just the comments on one side.

8 One of the reasons I think is most important
9 for conservation of the sheep in this area would be economic.
10 Basically, everybody wants to have an economic interest. And
11 I believe that wildlife, viewing wildlife watching could
12 become a major part of this area. With places like Joshua
13 Tree National Park right next door and the National Monument,
14 people would come to this area to view wildlife. And I think
15 that they are bringing money and staying in the hotels and
16 eating in the restaurants. And they are going to bring
17 revenue to the area if we have the wildlife for them to come
18 watch.

19 Another reason I think we should strive towards
20 conservation is because it is a political deal, and the
21 government mandates protection for species that are becoming
22 extinct. Of course, the Endangered Species Act is one of the
23 biggest pieces of legislation. It's a huge piece of law in
24 the government, and it's got a lot of power. I think that if
25 the species numbers continue to decline, the Fish and

108

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Wildlife Service is going to step in and there is going to be
2 a mandate for protection.

3 So why don't we start now? I think we could
4 make this area kind of a light, something for others to look
5 at. We could be a model for conservation. If people here in
6 the Coachella Valley, Palm Springs, Palm Desert are making a
7 huge effort to conserve a big species, something people want

8 to see, there are going to be a lot more people to come here.
9 Instead of just waiting for the government to step in and
10 say, "Hey, you have to protect these species," let's start in
11 to do it now and protect the species. Thanks.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Thank you very much. That's
13 the only person who signed up to speak. Is there anyone else
14 who wishes to speak? There being none, we will close the
15 public input section and go to Connell Dunning, session on
16 the Monument Plan. Connell.

17 While Connell is getting set up, it was called
18 to my attention that at the beginning of the meeting, we
19 didn't note that Mike was alternate, as it were. So perhaps,
20 Mike, you could give your full name and who you are sitting
21 in for.

22 MR. KELLNER: Michael Kellner.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Spell your name, please.

24 MR. KELLNER: M-i-c-h-a-e-l, K-e-l-l-n-e-r.

25 And I am sitting in for Barbara Gonzales-Lyons, and I'm the
109

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 environmental resources manager for the Agua Caliente Band of
2 Indians. Thank you.

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Sorry for that oversight.
4 Connell.

5 MS. DUNNING: First, I wanted to briefly tell
6 you the documents that were provided that have to do with the
7 plan. You do have a copy of the Monument Advisory Committee

8 recommendation, the final recommendation report that you
9 provided to us.

10 You have a preliminary draft, alternatives and
11 strategies chapter. Big words on top. This one.

12 Next time I will get some photos for you. And
13 you have a summary table. The summary table is the summary
14 of the actions -- the proposed actions that come out of
15 chapter 2. This is our preliminary Chapter 2.

16 The third item that we will be discussing
17 today, the Monument Advisory Committee Recommendation Tool.
18 That's what it says at the top. And this document takes word
19 for word what your recommendations were, along the left
20 column. And along the right column, we have entered the
21 section within the preliminary draft alternative strategies
22 where that recommendation is addressed. So you will be able
23 to hold both of those, when you go home tonight and look at
24 this stuff like I know you all are going to, and use those
25 two together to see how, once we took your recommendations

110

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 and ran them through the planner speak mill, how they came
2 out into what we have now, a preliminary draft.

3 What I wanted to do was to go through the
4 preliminary draft, just kind of section by section briefly so
5 that you can see where the different topics are proposed.

6 I also have this via Power Point, but I think
7 since everybody has this in front of you -- let me know if

8 you would like to see it via Power Point. I know Buford
9 doesn't.

10 But on the first page it is similar to what you
11 saw last time we spoke. The table of contents of what's
12 included in this chapter. And again, they are laid out by
13 those values that were called out in the legislation. Those
14 values that the legislation established the Monument to
15 protect: Biological, cultural, recreational, geological,
16 educational and scientific resources, followed by scenic,
17 because it was also established to protect the magnificent
18 vistas. We have a category of visitation, access, category
19 for fire management, a category for water resources
20 management, and acquisitions strategy, and then wilderness
21 inventory and management.

22 The next section, the adaptive management and
23 monitoring program, we are still building, but the actions we
24 proposed are included in here. Just going through the first
25 part, the first section, if you turn the page there is a

111

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 listing of the Monument Plan goal. These are the goals that
2 are common to the entire plan. There then is a listing of
3 the difference between strategy and alternatives. When we
4 are going through this document, we have a series of things
5 that are proposed strategies, strategies for managing
6 resources.

7 And then there are some things where there was
8 a range of alternatives where we are trying to determine,
9 given a range -- we are trying to determine what the
10 preferred action would be. So in some cases, you will see
11 it's either we are going to enact the strategy or we are not.
12 And other cases we are going to enact one of three new
13 actions or no action. So when we are going through here, it
14 will be clear, just picking up this summary table. For
15 example, the first thing that you see under biological
16 resources, this is our management strategy for noxious,
17 nonnative and invasive plant species. So it ranges -- it
18 covers what could have been an Alternative A , B or C, but as
19 we are presenting this, we think that this is a strategy that
20 we are proposing that we either will do or alternative D, we
21 won't do. And we will have a chapter of impact analysis
22 analyzing whether we do it or not. And that helps us choose
23 between going along with what we are doing or adopting
24 additional strategies.

25 Turning forward on the same summary table to --
112

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 we will get to that -- an example on page -- about page 12 is
2 an example where we have a range of alternatives, alternative
3 A, B and C for recreational shooting. There is obviously a
4 range of interests out there for shooting. And this is where
5 we have captured that range. And our impact analysis will
6 determine the impacts of each of these actions to many

7 different elements.

8 So when you see the plan when it comes out in
9 March, there will be a preferred identified. But we don't
10 have that right now. We don't have a preferred identified
11 because we are not through with our impact analysis, which we
12 are going to be doing -- obviously doing it right now, but we
13 are not done with that. So we are going to continue to do
14 that over the next week.

15 I know you guys have been seeing me at lots of
16 these meetings, but it's important to remind you of the team
17 of people that are behind these efforts. We have biologists,
18 archeologists and Fire Service and BLM folks who are actually
19 doing a lot of the impact analysis and helping to write and
20 create the document that you are seeing.

21 Does anybody have a question between the range
22 of alternative and the strategy, for example?

23 MR. WOODS: John Woods, Alpine Village.

24 As far as the strategy goes, in going through
25 this and looking at the page you are looking at as a good

113

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 example, you, with the BLM are going to determine the
2 preferred strategy?

3 MS. DUNNING: BLM and Forest Service together.

4 MR. WOODS: I'm a little confused about the
5 process. So this comes back to this committee for like an

6 approval or something that the committee is going to --

7 MS. DUNNING: In order to meet deadline,
8 congressional deadline to have this plan completed by
9 October 24, 2003, and working back over all the review
10 periods, we need to have a public draft by March 3. We are
11 shooting for March 3 of 2003. So that will be the next
12 opportunity when this will be out with a preferred
13 alternative identified for this committee, for the public and
14 everybody. And then a 90-day period to receive comments.

15 This committee will provide comments, as will
16 the public. We will be doing the road show and going around
17 and helping people understand that document. But in this
18 case, because of our short timeline, we do have to come up
19 with something in the next couple of weeks. So any further
20 input from this committee would be needed within the next
21 week.

22 MR. WOODS: When you become public with that
23 and your recommendation of one of the four, will you
24 recommend one of the four and that's part of your public
25 document?

114

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. DUNNING: Exactly. We have to identify a
2 preferred.

3 MR. WOODS: Will the public have access to the
4 other issues?

5 MS. DUNNING: It will come out exactly like

6 this, and it will be highlighted, the preferred will be
7 highlighted. And so you will be able to comment regarding
8 all of them. But the preferred will be highlighted. And the
9 key for this committee, for everyone in this room, if you are
10 looking through this, and, you know, does this include the
11 full range of suggestions that you brought forward as a
12 committee and also that you could perceive are out there from
13 the public, you are certainly representing a number of
14 constituents here at this table. So hopefully the
15 recommendations that you brought forward were able to be
16 included to the extent that we could for this document.

17 But since we have a little bit of time today, I
18 wanted to just go through section by section what we have
19 briefly.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Before we go farther, Allan.

21 MR. MUTH: I'm in my perennial state of
22 confusion. You are talking about recreational shooting, and
23 that's on page 17 that's in one without the --

24 MS. DUNNING: Yes, okay.

25 MR. MUTH: Where is that over in this other

115

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 document?

2 MR. CRITES: 12.

3 MS. DUNNING: As you are going through the big
4 document, we have the big document and the summary. As you
5 are going through the big document, as you come to action,

6 they are in the same order, there will be some things in the
7 big document that won't be in the summary. The things that
8 are in the big document are areas where we have identified
9 there is public concern, but we are not proposing any actions
10 at all. So we just put a little paragraph to let you know
11 what the status is, maybe a little reason why we are not
12 addressing that.

13 But this holds anything we are proposing as an
14 action, the summary table. So if you read something here
15 that you don't see here, that's why. It's because there is
16 no action proposed. It's our way to inform the public that
17 we hear you, we hear your concern, but another process is
18 dealing with that.

19 MR. WATLING: I do feel your pain?

20 MS. DUNNING: I do feel your pain daily.

21 MS. HENDERSON: While we are

22 cross-referencing, is there some cross-reference to the issue
23 statement number? For instance, if we are dealing with issue
24 statement No. 2, trail and structure maintenance, is there an
25 immediate cross-reference that I can make into these two

116

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 references?

2 MS. DUNNING: For the purposes of cross-
3 referencing, these numbers do not mean anything, the numbers
4 in the left-hand column. Those were the numbers from your
5 report. So where numbers do mean something is where it's

6 actually a section heading. And there is a reason why there
7 is not a page number. It's because they are continuously
8 changing. So we went with a section heading because even in
9 a final, in the next version that you see where the page
10 numbers might change, the section will stay the same. So for
11 purposes --

12 MS. HENDERSON: Section 2?

13 MS. DUNNING: Chapter 2.

14 MS. HENDERSON: That's not issue statement 2.

15 MS. DUNNING: No, it's not. The numbers along
16 the left-hand column don't mean anything else from this point
17 forward.

18 MS. HENDERSON: Okay. I'll sit and listen.

19 MS. DUNNING: The other thing we could have
20 done is provided you with exact page numbers.

21 MS. HENDERSON: No, no, I understand why you
22 can't give us page numbers. Certainly the issues aren't
23 going to change.

24 MS. DUNNING: No. We address them in whatever
25 order we got to them when we did. This is a little bit more

117

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 organization structure of the plan.

2 MS. HENDERSON: Because this is going by the
3 legislation?

4 MS. DUNNING: Yes.

5 MS. HENDERSON: Was it worth it to put the

6 issues into the same order as the legislation, if that's what
7 we are going to do?

8 MS. DUNNING: I believe all of the information
9 you provided is captured. And we could have done that, but
10 all of the information is captured.

11 MS. HENDERSON: I wasn't going to uncapture
12 any of the information, but maybe retitle it. It's fine.

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Connell, question on page 17
14 of 36 in the big document, as you referred to it. What is
15 that black space there?

16 MS. DUNNING: That's my little indication that
17 I need to talk to Eddy. Because -- there is a Fish and Game
18 requirement for how many feet away you have to be from a
19 water source when you are hunting. Eddy, is that 150? Eddy
20 knows. So that's what it is.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So you will later on put a
22 number in there?

23 MS. DUNNING: I didn't want to put the wrong
24 one in there.

25 MR. KELLNER: It's a draft.

118

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. DUNNING: This is a preliminary draft.
2 And when it comes out to the public, it will still be a
3 draft.

4 MR. WOODS: For purposes of a little clarity,
5 could we think of the other two or three documents that we

6 have as being more of a bibliography for the one in your hand
7 and maybe work off of that document?

8 MS. DUNNING: Work off the big document?

9 MR. WOODS: Because everything is cut and
10 paste, as I have seen.

11 MS. DUNNING: Yes, we can do that.

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Connell, I guess I'm a
13 little confused as to what you are looking for here. My
14 understanding is that we have all the information. If we are
15 interested, we can read through it and see if there is any
16 additions, deletions that we would have a concern with, and
17 in the next week or week and a half, individually we could
18 call you and call that concern to your attention?

19 MS. DUNNING: Certainly.

20 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: And that the committee input
21 will then come at our April meeting. So I would question the
22 need, since it's format only, that we would go through this
23 page for page. Does anyone have an argument with that?

24 MS. DUNNING: The key, certainly, is that you
25 understand what you are looking at and where the information
119

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 comes from.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Allan, of course, can't
3 speak for him, but -- perrenially?

4 MS. DUNNING: I would like to emphasize -- you
5 mentioned a week and a half potentially. I would like to

6 emphasize a week is all that we have, given our timeline.

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: So does everyone feel
8 comfortable with that, rather than utilize this time to just
9 go through. I personally would like to sit down and actually
10 read it and compare it.

11 MR. LYMAN: Would you send an e-mail around to
12 each of us just as a reminder, for comments, starts Monday,
13 ends Friday.

14 MR. KIBBEY: I will task Danella with that.

15 MS. GEORGE: No problem.

16 MR. KELLNER: Barbara Lyons wanted me to
17 mention, just as far as like commenting, she took the
18 comments, the draft comments on the cultural issues to the
19 TASIN , T-A-S-I-N, work group and shared those comments, this
20 is on the cultural committee only, with the TASIN members.
21 And the one comment they had -- and I see that Connell has
22 already got it in here -- is on page 2-C-11, biological
23 alternatives A, B and C, just that the Southern California
24 Indian Basketweavers organization would be included to review
25 noxious weed/invasive species actions plans.

120

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's on page 436.

2 MR. KELLNER: You are taking comments up
3 until --

4 MS. DUNNING: Right. Right. Certainly we
5 have taken your task to recommend Secretary of Agriculture

6 and the Secretary of Interior respective to the plan, and
7 certainly we are taking those comments. And also, you know,
8 some of the comments that you get in, let's say you can give
9 a comment on February 27. Well, we can still take those from
10 the draft, so this is not a final. What you see on March
11 3rd, there is going to be another 90-day window. It is a
12 continuous process for us to work with the plan to get it to
13 be as great as you can. So anything you can get by Friday
14 would be great. Anything that needs clarification or doesn't
15 make sense to you, little comments like that would certainly
16 help.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: You have your homework
18 assignment, group.

19 MR. PARKINS: Does this incorporate some of
20 the State Parks issues, as well?

21 MS. DUNNING: The first run of getting
22 everything in there as an action was trying to capture
23 everything. The second thing as we are going through our
24 edits is making sure we are including all the partners in
25 every place we need to. So in any of these sections, if you
121

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 feel the partner needs to be called out, whatever the partner
2 needs to be.

3 MR. PARKINS: Just looking at the recreational
4 resources, pets. And to my knowledge, in the State Park,
5 pets are not allowed. At least we throw them off the tram.

6 MS. DUNNING: Right.

7 MR. PARKINS: No, we don't let them get on.

8 MS. DUNNING: One thing to keep in mind as you
9 are reading this plan, the BLM and Forest Service, we can
10 only propose actions applying to federal land. The actions
11 we are proposing, we can only apply to federal lands. The
12 idea might be something that we can look at long-term to work
13 with other groups, but the actions here, when you are
14 imagining the Monument apply only to the Forest Service and
15 BLM.

16 MR. PARKINS: When we started, we had the
17 matrix that included all the various partners. And I am
18 curious as to why it fell out.

19 MS. DUNNING: Well, we don't have the ability
20 to -- we can include something like the matrix in the
21 appendix of the plan very easily. This is the type of
22 management and how it occurs elsewhere. But it won't fit in
23 this section where we pull out, okay, here is what we are
24 assigning to do differently. But that kind of information
25 can be tracked.

122

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. HENDERSON: If we can include it and track
2 it, we can enforce it or mandate it. But why can't we cross-
3 reference on the same page, but underneath where we are and
4 then put down at the bottom, "unenforceable state
5 regulations" or some reference so that they aren't looking in

6 the back and then going back and trying to see where it fits
7 in.

8 MR. PARKINS: Or "enforced by others." One of
9 the things I thought was most significant about this body is
10 we do have a consortium of interests represented. And I
11 think it would make sense in what evolves from us that we
12 ought to incorporate the partners' issues, as well.

13 MS. HENDERSON: Even if we don't have control
14 over it, we have it right where the information is and not
15 have to look someplace else for it.

16 MR. FREET: Connell, I thought I understood
17 this document , but now I need some help. If you look on the
18 front page, it says 2-C-9 for fire management.

19 MS. DUNNING: Sorry. The numbers --

20 MR. FREET: Do you know where I am going?

21 MS. DUNNING: I do. The numbers as they
22 occur -- I apologize, I can send you each an updated
23 numbering system on the front. As we have added things, yes,
24 the numbers have changed a bit. I can send you an updated --

25 MR. FREET: That's fine.

123

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. DUNNING: They are there, and I apologize
2 for that, but we have added a couple of sections so it has
3 thrown that numbering system off.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella.

5 MS. GEORGE: I was going to ask, do you want
6 to make a motion on what I think I heard the committee say,
7 that you would like to include somewhere front-end of the
8 document, maybe in chapter 1, as we talk about the Monument
9 in chapter 1 and why we are doing the plan, the matrix there?

10 MS. DUNNING: I have a comment that maybe
11 after we finish this draft where the focus really is, the
12 actions that apply to Forest Service and BLM lands, that when
13 we come out with a final plan, that we present the whole
14 picture to everybody when it's done.

15 But my concern is that having that information,
16 it's already kind of a complex system for people to review
17 and to provide their comments. And my concern is that we may
18 get a number of comments that are actually applicable to
19 State Parks and applicable to the other jurisdictions that we
20 can't respond to. So perhaps when we come out with our final
21 plan, we can have that maybe in the appendix, but then move
22 it up to a more well-rounded document.

23 MR. PARKINS: I understand what your concern
24 is. We are not seeking comments on whether the State Parks
25 and Recreation Department --

124

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. DUNNING: Exactly.

2 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Terry.

3 MS. HENDERSON: Well, I understand too, but
4 why are they sitting at this table if we are not seeking

5 comments from them and why are they participating in the
6 process?

7 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Wait a minute, please. Rob.

8 MR. PARKINS: Maybe I misstated that. Their
9 comments ought to be incorporated within what we are
10 concerned about. But when she is putting the document out
11 for public comment, it's not the State -- Department of Parks
12 and Recreation's rules and regulations that are subject to
13 comment. So what I am understanding from planner-speak is
14 she wants to incorporate the consortium of interests in the
15 document, but she wants to do it in a method which will allow
16 the Forest Service/BLM part of it to be that which the public
17 comments upon.

18 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Terry, are you satisfied
19 now?

20 MS. HENDERSON: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Rob , you are satisfied?

22 MR. PARKINS: Yes, sir, I'm happy with the
23 situation.

24 MS. DUNNING: That will also give us more time
25 to incorporate language that you agree with and can help us

125

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 write, because we do have a number of partners that we would
2 actually need to spend more time with in getting language
3 down that -- the matrix is a starting point, but it's
4 certainly not ready for --

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any other questions or
6 comments on this? Again, you have your homework assignment.
7 If you have any immediate suggestions, questions, comments,
8 please get it to Connell prior to next Friday. Otherwise, as
9 a group we will look through the product at that time at our
10 April meeting.

11 MR. PARKINS: Does the record note that we
12 don't throw pets off the tram?

13 (Discussion was held off the record.)

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: We are getting out of hand
15 here. Danella.

16 MS. GEORGE: I would again like to thank
17 Connell. Connell has been working diligently. I think she
18 worked the last holiday on creating this material for
19 everybody. There is another team of folks working with her
20 too. And so -- and then we have these things at work where
21 like last night, I guess the infrastructure broke down,
22 Connell. It always breaks down right before a MAC meeting.

23 MS. DUNNING: You guys, a copier machine.

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, I would suggest then
25 that a round of applause is in order.

126

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 (Applause from the audience.)

2 MS. DUNNING: I will carry that back to the
3 team of people that put this document together.

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Danella , we are going to

5 summarize the meeting and needs for April MAC meeting.

6 MS. GEORGE: Danella George, Monument manager.

7 I thought I would go over what I thought were
8 motions and agreements that were made today. The first one
9 was we agreed that not only would we look at the two-year,
10 but the three-year staggered appointment to have that process
11 for that nomination go forward. We all agreed to that.

12 Then I also agreed to attempt to try and have
13 that process out to the media by March 1st. We will give it
14 our best to do that for the announcement of the nomination
15 process.

16 We agreed to recharter the advisory committee
17 and do that for a two-year period. And we also created a
18 mission statement, the advisory committee did that, and their
19 mission is "Representing the people and caring for the
20 National Monument."

21 I agreed to also send out an e-mail reminder
22 this week to all the MAC members to please get their comments
23 to Connell by Friday, February 7, '03. Anything else?

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good. Anything else?

25 MS. GEORGE: How about an informational tour?

127

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: One thing at a time. Now,
2 Danella has a little bit of thinking about some more
3 traveling.

4 MS. GEORGE: You had mentioned an interest,

5 Mr. Chair, in having a fieldtrip to the Indian Canyons. And
6 last year we kind of waited until it was too late with the
7 hot season. So I wanted to see if the committee was
8 interested in going on an informational tour to the Indian
9 Canyons, say, about March. We could set that up with
10 Barbara. She is aware of this, Michael.

11 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comment?

12 MR. BOGERT: Can you do it on horseback?

13 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: If you provide the horses.

14 Any interest in this? We are trying to find
15 out.

16 MR. MUTH: Yes, there is an interest. Early
17 or late March.

18 MS. HENDERSON: If we can set a date.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: That's the next thing.
20 First we have an interest and then we set a date. So here
21 goes the exercise for setting a date, which is always a bear.
22 Danella, throw one out.

23 MS. GEORGE: March 11th.

24 MR. MUTH: No.

25 MS. HENDERSON: Yes.

128

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 MS. GEORGE: March 12.

2 (Discussion was held off the record.)

3 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Back on the record. We will
4 try the 31st of March. You will check with Barbara on that.

5 MS. GEORGE: Yes, sir. Also from this
6 exercise we just experienced, I talked with Laurie, and we
7 probably want to think about a date in the summer for an
8 informational tour up to look at the red trees and the fire
9 danger up there, accessibility, those sorts of issues. Would
10 we want to set a date for a fieldtrip? What month would you
11 like in the summer? When would work for you?

12 MS. ROSENTHAL: We may be closed but assuming
13 we are not, probably May.

14 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: May, did you say?

15 MS. ROSENTHAL: May.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Why don't we look at it then
17 in your April meeting.

18 MS. GEORGE: Mr. Chair, seeing the frustration
19 and needing to calendar out two or three months ahead , I
20 would propose we go ahead and go off the record on the
21 calendaring process and get a May date.

22 MS. HENDERSON: I have no problem with what
23 Danella says except I didn't hear what it was that we are
24 setting the date for.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: To look at dead trees. Do
129

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 you want to go ahead and try for a May date today? All
2 right. Off the record.

3 (Discussion was held off the record.)

4 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Back on the record. It

5 would appear that May 19th will be acceptable for the tree
6 tour.

7 Frank.

8 MR. BOGERT: Danella, wouldn't it be an idea
9 to see Joshua National Park and see how they run it and what
10 they do?

11 MS. GEORGE: I think it would be a great trip.
12 Yes, Joshua Tree National Park as an informational tour.
13 Would you like me to research that with Ernie Quintana and
14 come back with information?

15 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Comments? Allan, you are
16 shaking your head.

17 MR. MUTH: It had to do with the name of the
18 superintendent.

19 MS. GEORGE: I'm sorry. Ernie has gone on to
20 senior executive service. I apologize, although I just got a
21 letter from Ernie, so I don't know who the acting is.

22 MR. HAVERT: Curt Sauer, S-a-u-e-r, I think.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: What do we think? Does
24 Joshua Tree National Monument make a good trip. Fall?

25 MR. BOGERT: Any time.

130

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Well, you don't want to do
2 it in the summer.

3 MR. BOGERT: No, in October-September.

4 MS. GEORGE: I will come back for the April

5 meeting with information on a Joshua Tree National Park tour.
6 And that way the new superintendent can meet the cast of
7 characters, come fall.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: When, Danella, do you think
9 you will have the answer on the Indian Canyons tour?

10 MS. GEORGE: I'm sorry, Mr. Chair. What
11 answer do you need?

12 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Like the time and where we
13 meet and all the sort of things that are necessary to get
14 this group there.

15 MS. GEORGE: Okay. I will coordinate with the
16 tribe and get that to you probably within the next two weeks.

17 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good.

18 MR. BOGERT: What will you do? Go into Pinyon
19 Canyon, Palm Canyon, walk in?

20 MS. GEORGE: Are there specific things folks
21 would like to do? Walk? Things they want to see? Now would
22 be the time to let us know as we design the tour. Anything
23 folks want to see?

24 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: I think that would best be
25 outlined by the tribe, who has the best understanding of what

131

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 is there and what is interesting and what applies to this
2 group. Mike?

3 MR. KELLNER: Okay, we will put together an

4 agenda.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Allan, you had other
6 comments?

7 MR. MUTH: Why is it the host would want us
8 there in the first place? What is it they have to show?

9 MS. GEORGE: Mr. Chair, a little further
10 comment. Laurie and I are going to take a tour out there
11 with Michael and some other folks in the month of February.
12 So we will work on trying to design something that meets all
13 your needs with the tribes, what the tribe wants to show.
14 Does that work, Frank?

15 MR. BOGERT: Good. Very good.

16 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Anything else on tours? Do
17 we have any other subjects, conversations, that we want to
18 undertake before we adjourn? Again, thank you very much for
19 your attendance. Appreciate it. It allows Danella to keep
20 bragging. Her group always has --

21 MS. ROCHE: I just asked if Buford was doing
22 lunch next time, because that was the deal he made with me.

23 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Very good point. Hold it.
24 You are serving lunch?

25 MR. CRITES: I will bring again the soft

132

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 drinks, as we did this time, and we will volunteer to do the
2 third lunch.

3 MS. HENDERSON: I will certainly carry back

4 the message to my city, and I make no guarantees.

5 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: For the moment, it will be
6 tentative La Quinta?

7 MS. HENDERSON: Yes.

8 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Jeff. I have a comment.

9 MR. MORGAN: I have a comment regarding trails
10 mapping. If you go to the desert map shop and buy the new
11 topo map for Palm View Peak, it shows the trail from the west
12 fork going up to see the springs in the wrong place. It's
13 about three-quarters of a mile off. So anyone who is doing
14 the trail maps for the Monument, of the area, I suggest you
15 don't refer to that. Either check with someone who has
16 actually mapped it with the GPS, and don't just take the
17 trail delineation from the map and move it onto yours because
18 you would be half a mile off.

19 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Frank, you had a comment.

20 MR. BOGERT: I want to volunteer the lunch in
21 2004.

22 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Any specific month?

23 MR. BOGERT: No.

24 MR. HAVERT: Entire year.

25 CHAIRMAN KIBBEY: Is there anything else? We
133

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 stand adjourned.

2 (The committee was adjourned at 1:45 p.m.)

3

4 R E P O R T E R ' S C E R T I F I C A T E

5

6 I, Judith W. Gillespie, a certified shorthand
7 reporter, do hereby certify that the foregoing pages comprise
8 a full, true and correct transcription of the proceedings had
9 and the testimony taken at the hearing in the
10 hereinbefore-entitled matter of February 1, 2003.

11 Dated this 23rd day of February, 2003, at
12 Riverside, California.

13

14

15

16

17

18

Judith W. Gillespie, CSR No. 3710

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

134

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 ** Worksheet **Trial/Delivery Date: ASAP

2 Date: Saturday, February 1, 2003 Job No.: 61999JG

3 Reporter: Judith W. Gillespie, 3710

Location: Palm Desert City Hall

Court: CO Case No.: C7

4 -----
MAC ADVISORY COMMITTEE (Monument ADVISORY COMMITTEE)
5 -----

Appearances:

6 Monument ADVISORY COMMITTEE (MAC):

7 FRANK BOGERT, Former Mayor, City of,
8 ROBERT BROCKMAN, Director of Community Development, City of
Rancho Mirage
9 BUFORD CRITES, Councilmember and Former Mayor, City of Palm
Desert
10 BARY FREET,, Fire Chief, Resident of Cathedral City
MICHAEL KELLNER, representing BARBARA GONZALES LYONS,
11 Tribal Council, Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians
LARRY GRAFTON, Senior Planner, City of Indian Wells
12 TERRY HENDERSON, Councilmember, City of La Quinta
EDWARD KIBBEY, Committee Chairman, Building Industry
Association
13 BOB LYMAN, Regional Office Manager, County of Riverside
JEFFERY MORGAN, Sierra Club, Local Conservation
14 Organization
ALLAN MUTH, University of California, Riverside, Deep
15 Canyon Research Center
ROB PARKINS, General Manager for the, Aerial
16 Tramway, Winter Park Authority
WILLIAM (GARY) WATTS, District Superintendent, California
17 Department of Parks and Recreation

18 -----
REPORTER'S TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

19 Time: 9 a.m. to 1:45 p.m. Pursuant to:
Pages: 134 Exhibits: Na Copies: 0 & 1
20 -----

21 Stipulation: Danella George gets e-tran; she reads and
corrects and sends corrections to us. We make corrections
22 and send O+1 to her.

23 Billing and Delivery:

0 & 1 - Danella George/Monument manager

24 Rate: Hearing Time: Sat. Per diem Hrs. Mileage: Palm
25 Desert

135

GILLESPIE REPORTING & DOCUMENT MANAGEMENT, INC.

1 Word List:

To check, Danella: Thomas Mountain / Bautista Canyon /
2 DeAnza / Rincon / Mike Pool / Blackwell / Don Able / Pinyon
or Pinyon / Gene Zimmerman / Tracie Liegler / Carizzo / Ford
3 Plan / Ray Bansfield / Phil Metica / DWMAs / John
Ratherberger / Tim Blixseth / Boohoff Trail / Morrow Trail /

4 Art Smith Trail / Dunn Road / Mike Schuler / Guy Wagner /
Wanda Raschkow / Tacheva Canyon / Homme Adams / North Likken
5 Trail / Omstott Creek / Karl McArthur / Curt Sauer

6 DANELLA: COULD YOU PLEASE CHECK THESE SPELLINGS FOR ME AND
INCLUDE THE CORRECTIONS IN YOUR LIST? THANKS. JUST THOUGHT
7 THAT WOULD BE A FASTER WAY TO DO IT THAN SENDING THEM
SEPARATELY AND WAITING TO CORRECT BEFORE YOU GET THE
8 TRANSCRIPT. WAS REALLY GREAT WORKING WITH YOU AND YOUR CREW.
YOU'RE VERY EFFICIENT AND HOSPITABLE. JUDY. E-MAIL ME AT
9 GRDM&EARTHLINK.NET

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25